Zevachim 84 – Good Morning Raboisai

Summary of Reb Eli Stefansky's Shiur

1️⃣ Introduction — The Five-Way Machlokes on "Lo Yered"

We continue with the major sugya:

Which disqualified items, once placed on the Mizbeach, must be removed — and which stay?

The entire perek revolves around the phrase:
"כָּל הָעוֹלֶה עַל גַּבֵּי הַמִּזְבֵּחַ — לֹא יֵרֵד"
(*Once something goes up, it does not come down.*)

There are **five Tannaim**, each identifying a different *keyword* in the pesukim that determines what stays:

1. **רבי יהושע — "אִשֶּׁים"**
    - The key is **fire**.
    - Anything that is *burned* on the Mizbeach stays.
    - Wine & blood → **not burned** → must come down.
2. **רבן גמליאל — "מִזְבֵּחַ"**
    - The key is **Mizbeach-service**, not fire.
    - Wine & blood *do* go on the Mizbeach → stay.
3. **רבי שמעון — "עוֹלָה" (לְעַצְמוֹ)**
    - The key is:

It must be a korban that comes **by itself**, independently.

- Wine brought *with* a korban = not independent → must come down.
- Wine brought **alone** → stays.

4. **רבי יוסי הגלילי — "כְּבָשִׂים"**
    - The model is **animal offerings**.
    - Only items comparable to an *animal* stay.
    - Flour/oil/wine → not animals → must come down.
5. **רבי עקיבא — "עוֹלָה"**

- Similar to kvassim, but includes **עֹלַת הָעוֹף**, the bird-olah.
- So he includes **birds**; Rabbi Yosi excludes them.

This framework makes the entire sugya straightforward.

---

2 Rabbi Shimon — "Atzmu'i" (Independent Korban)

Rabbi Shimon's drasha:

עוֹלָה → must be something that is brought *on its own*, not as a side requirement.

This excludes:

- **Nesachim** brought **with** another korban → must come down.
- But nesachim **brought independently** → stay.

This becomes crucial shortly.

---

3 The Pesukim — Universal Inclusion vs. Limiting Phrases

The Torah says:

1. **"כָּל אֲשֶׁר יִגַּע בַּמִּזְבֵּחַ יִקְדָּשׁ"**
   → Sounds fully inclusive: *anything* that touches the Mizbeach becomes holy.
2. **"כְּבָשִׂים"** & **"עוֹלָה"**
   → Limitations: Only things fitting the model of an *olah* or *animal* stay.

Thus, the machlokes is:
Do we emphasize the inclusive pasuk or the limiting pasuk?

---

4 Difference Between "Kvassim" and "Olah" — The Case of Bird-Olah

Rabbi Yosi (Kvassim)

- Learns from animal → excludes birds.

Rabbi Akiva (Olah)

- Learns from the korban olah → **includes birds**.

Thus:

- Bird olah on the Mizbeach:
  - **Rabbi Akiva:** stays

- **Rabbi Yosi:** must come down

---

5 Rav Pappa — The Huge Nafka Mina: Minchas Nesachim

A critical question:

What about a Minchas Nesachim (flour/oil that accompany a korban)?

Does it stay if placed on the Mizbeach?

Using our chart:

- **Rabbi Yoshua:** stays (it burns)
- **Rabban Gamliel:** stays (it goes on Mizbeach)
- **Rabbi Shimon:** stays (when it comes by itself)
  BUT
- **Rabbi Yosi haGelili:** must come down (not an animal)
- **Rabbi Akiva:** must come down (not an "olah")

This is the only major area where the five opinions split clearly.

---

6 Rish Lakish's Major Summary — but What Was He Adding?

Rish Lakish presents a long **synopsis** of the sugya:

- If a Mincha comes **by itself** → stays
- If a Mincha comes **with a korban** → depends on Tannaim
- If nesachim arrive separately → again depends on the Tannaim

But the Gemara challenges:

Why review the entire sugya if the only chiddush is:
A Minchas Nesachim may be brought independently?

Answer:

The review teaches that even though Nesachim *can* be brought alone,
Rabbi Shimon still holds they must come down when brought together *with* a korban.

Thus the synopsis teaches a subtle halachic boundary.

---

7 The Massive New List — Items That *Stay* on the Mizbeach (לֹא יֵרֵד)

Provided they were placed on the Mizbeach, these **do not come down**:

1. **Nosar** (leftover past time)
2. **Yotzei** (left the Azarah)
3. **Tamei**
4. **Pigul**
5. **P'sulin** done by invalid Kohanim

Why?

Because the psul occurred **inside** the Beis HaMikdash —
not externally.

This distinction is vital for the next list.

---

8 Rabbi Yehuda — The Unifying Principle: "Has a Heter Somewhere Else"

Rabbi Yehuda explains why the above items stay:

They each possess **some context of permissibility**:

- **Pigul** → The act of shechita was kosher (required) even with bad intent
- **Nosar** → Other korbanos have two days to eat
- **Tamei** → Tumah is overridden by *Tzibbur*
- **Yotzei** → In a *Bamah*, everything is outside
- **Pasul Kohen** → He is temporarily disqualified, not inherently invalid

Because each has a *shadow of heter*, if placed on the Mizbeach:

לֹא יֵרֵד— they stay.

---

9 The Opposite List — Things That *Must Come Down* (יֵרֵד)

These are items with **no heter anywhere**, including:

1. **Animal used for prohibited relations (רָבוּעַ / נִרְבָּע)**
2. **Animal worshipped as Avodah Zarah (מוּקְצֶה / נֶעֱבַד)**
3. **Esnan** (gift to a zonah)
4. **Mechir Kelev** (exchange for a dog)

5. **Kilayim** (hybrid animals)
6. **Treifah**
7. **Yotzei Dofen (C-section birth)**
8. **Ba'al Mum** (disputed by R' Akiva)

These have **no circumstance** in which they are valid for the Mizbeach → must come down.

🔟 Why Don't the Two Lists Collapse Into One?

The Gemara asks:

Why place some disqualified items in "Lo Yered" and some in "Yered"?
Why not learn one list from the other?

Answer:

The Torah uses the limiting word **"עוֹלָה"**, implying:
Only *some* invalid items stay — not all.

Thus the Sages construct a list governed by **conceptual similarity**, not arbitrary rules.

1️⃣1️⃣ Rabbi Yehuda's Final Principle — "Zos Toras HaOlah"

A crucial pasuk:

זֹאת תּוֹרַת הָעוֹלָה → Applies broadly
Even to items that now are pasul —
if they ever had a *moment* of eligibility ("שֶׁעָתָּה כּוֹשֶׁר")
→ they do not come down.

This is the backbone of his entire approach.

✨ Takeaway – Zevachim 84

- The sugya identifies **five frameworks** for deciding what stays on the Mizbeach.
- Rabbi Shimon's rule ("comes independently") is pivotal for **Nesachim**.
- Rish Lakish's long summary teaches the boundary between "brought by itself" and "brought with a korban."
- Items that had *some halachic permissibility* in another context → **stay**.

- Items fundamentally invalid across all contexts → **must come down**.
- “Zos Toras HaOlah” broadens “Lo Yered” to anything that once had a moment of eligibility.

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל