Menachos 6 – Good Morning Raboisai

---

1 "מִן הַבָּקָר" — Excluding a Treifah

The daf opens by revisiting the pasuk **"מִן הַבָּקָר"**, which teaches that a **treifah** (an animal with a fatal internal injury that cannot live 12 months) is **pasul** to be brought as a korban .

Examples of treifah:

- Punctured lung
- Hole in the heart
- Severed spine

Core question of the daf:

Why do we need a **pasuk**?
Shouldn't this be obvious from logic?

---

2 The Attempted Kal VaChomer — and Why It Fails

Proposed kal va'chomer:

- A **baal mum** (blemished animal)
  – permitted to eat privately
  – **pasul** on the Mizbeach
- A **treifah**
  – forbidden even to eat
  – certainly should be pasul on the Mizbeach

So why a pasuk?

The Gemara explains:

This kal va'chomer is flawed, because there are multiple cases where something forbidden to an individual **is permitted** on the Mizbeach.

---

3 Rejected Proofs: Shabbos, Milah, and Shaatnez

Several attempted proofs are rejected:

- **Shabbos**:
  Melachah is forbidden to an individual but permitted for korbanos
  → Rejected, because Shabbos itself is overridden for mitzvos like **bris milah**
- **Milah**:
  Not a personal benefit, but a mitzvah commanded by Hashem
- **Shaatnez**:
  Forbidden to wear, yet permitted in:
    - Bigdei kehunah
    - Tzitzis
      → Still mitzvah-driven exceptions

Conclusion:

These cases don't prove that a treifah may be brought as a korban.

---

4 Malika and Blood — A Circular Problem

More attempted comparisons:

- **Malika** (killing a bird with the fingernail):
    - Forbidden for personal consumption
    - Permitted on the Mizbeach
- **Blood**:
    - Forbidden to eat
    - Central to avodah

But each comparison collapses:

- Malika is a **unique Torah command**
- Blood comes from a **kosher animal**

We end up in a **circular argument**:
Every case has a weakness, and none fully parallels treifah.

---

5 The Key Distinction — Visibility vs. Hidden Defects

Crucial yesod:

- **Baal mum** → visible defect

- **Treifah** → hidden, internal defect

A treifah can look perfectly healthy.
Therefore:

You cannot learn treifah from baal mum through logic alone.

This is why the Torah **must explicitly exclude** treifah with a pasuk.

---

6 The Bird Chatas — A Unique Case of Treifah

A striking exception:

- By **Chatas ha'of**:
    - The Kohen performs **malika**
    - This creates a **treifah**
    - Yet the bird:
        - Goes on the Mizbeach
        - Is partially eaten by the Kohen

Insight:

- The bird becomes permitted **because** it was designated for the Mizbeach
- The heter flows **from the Mizbeach outward**, not the reverse

This shows:

Treifah status alone is not decisive without a pasuk.

---

7 "מִמַּשְׁקֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל" — What Must Be Fit

Another source:

- Korbanos must come from items **fit for Jewish consumption**

But:

- **Orlah** and **Kilayim** were never permitted
- A **treifah** was once permitted and only later became forbidden

This difference forces the Torah to spell out:

Even a treifah — despite its prior permissibility — is excluded.

8️⃣ Maaser Behemah — A Supporting Proof

By **maaser behemah**:

- A treifah is **excluded from the count**
- This reinforces:
    - A treifah cannot acquire korban status at all

Thus, multiple pesukim converge:

Treifah is categorically excluded from the Mizbeach.

9️⃣ Transition to Minchah — Who May Perform Kemitzah

The daf concludes by shifting back to **Minchos**:

Kemitzah is invalid if performed by:

- **Zar**
- **Onen**
- **Tevul yom**
- **Mechusar begadim**
- **Arel**
- **Yoshev**
- Someone standing on an object (not directly on the floor)
- Using the **left hand**

Ben Beseira:

- If done with the left hand → put it back and redo properly

Key clarification:

- Some פסולים are **fixable**
- Others invalidate permanently

✨ Takeaway – Menachos 6

- A treifah requires explicit Torah exclusion
- Kal va’chomer fails due to multiple mitzvah-based exceptions
- Hidden defects differ fundamentally from visible blemishes
- Malika shows that treifah can exist **within** a Torah-sanctioned process
- “Mimashkei Yisrael” is nuanced, not absolute
- Kemitzah has strict requirements, but some errors can be repaired
- The Torah balances **logic**, **exceptions**, and **explicit command**

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל