Menachos 5 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Korbanos That Are "Matirim" — Rav's Fundamental Rule

We begin with **Rav's shittah**:

There are korbanos whose entire purpose is **not kaparah**, but to **permit** something — they are called **מַתִּירִים (matirim)**.

Examples:

- **Omer** → permits eating **chadash** (new grain)
- **Asham Metzora** → permits the Metzora:
    - to enter the Mikdash
    - to eat kodshim
- **Korban Yoledes / Nazir** → permits normal status

Rav's rule:

If a korban that serves as a *matir* is done **shelo lishmah**,
it has **failed its purpose** and is **discarded entirely**.

2️⃣ The Challenge — Asham Metzora Is Not Discarded

The Gemara challenges Rav from a clear case:

By **Asham Metzora**:

- Even if the blood was **not placed correctly** (e.g. oil before blood),
- The korban is **not thrown away**
- It is completed on the Mizbeach,
- And a **second Asham** is brought to fix the process

This contradicts Rav:

If Asham Metzora is a matir — why isn't it discarded?

3️⃣ Reish Lakish — A Direct Dispute with Rav

Reish Lakish argues strongly on Rav:

- A *failed matir* is **not discarded**
- It is:
    - Fully offered
    - But **does not permit**
- The owner must bring **another korban** to achieve the heter

Applied to **Omer**:

- First Omer done shelo lishmah:
    - Is offered on the Mizbeach
    - Does **not** permit chadash
- A **second Omer** is required

---

4 Rabbi — Even Stronger Than Reish Lakish

Rabbi (Rebbi) goes even further:

- The Omer done shelo lishmah:
    - Is **fully valid**
    - **Does permit chadash**
    - **No second Omer is needed**

So we now have **three shittos**:

1. **Rav** → discard it
2. **Reish Lakish** → offer it, but bring another
3. **Rabbi** → offer it, and it works completely

---

5 "מִמַּשְׁקֵּי יִשְׂרָאֵל" — A Serious Objection

The Gemara raises a powerful problem:

Rule:

Anything brought on the Mizbeach must be
edible to Klal Yisrael — *mimashkei Yisrael*

But:

- Omer is made from **chadash**
- Chadash is **forbidden to eat**
- So how can it be offered at all?

---

6 First Answer — "It Will Be Edible Today"

Resolution:

- Chadash becomes permitted **later that same day**
- Something that is:
    - **Mechusar zman for a few hours**
    - Is still considered *ra'ui*

Rule:

Mechusar zman b'yom is *not* a disqualification

Therefore:

- The Omer qualifies as **mimashkei Yisrael**

---

7 Proof from Birds and Ketores

Supporting logic:

- **Birds** are slaughtered via **melikah**
    - Forbidden everywhere else
    - Yet permitted in the Mikdash
- **Ketores** is forbidden for private use
    - Yet required in the Mikdash

Conclusion:

When the Torah *commands* a specific act,
its normal prohibitions do not apply.

The Omer is similar:

- Its very mitzvah requires **chadash**

---

8 Order Matters — “כֵּן תּוֹרַת” Means Exactly

The daf shifts to **order-sensitive avodah**:

By **Asham Metzora**:

- Blood must come **before** oil
- If oil is applied first:
    - That step is invalid
    - Oil must be reapplied **after blood**

This shows:

When the Torah says “כֵּן תּוֹרַת”
→ the order is **me’akev**

---

9 But Not Everything Is Order-Sensitive

Important distinction:

- **Avodah** (blood placement, oil application):
    - Order **is me’akev**
- **Shechitah**:
    - Is *not* an avodah
    - May be done by a zar
    - Order **does not invalidate**

Thus:

- Shechting Chatas before Asham (same day):
    - Is **not** a problem

---

10 “תּוּבַר צוּרְתָהּ” — How to Dispose of Kodshim

When something must be discarded:

- We do **not burn it immediately**
- We let it sit overnight (**linah**)

- Once its form is halachically ruined:
  → it may be burned

This preserves **kavod kodshim**.

1️⃣1️⃣ Treifah — Why the Torah Had to Exclude It

The Torah says:

"מִן הַבָּקָר" — excluding a **treifah**

Question:

- Why do we need a pasuk?
- Shouldn't it be obvious from a **kal vachomer**?

Answer:

- Kal vachomer fails:
  - Omer and Ketores prove that something forbidden to people may still be brought to Hashem
- Therefore:
  - Treifah required **explicit exclusion**

✨ Takeaway – Menachos 5

- Matirim korbanos spark a major three-way machlokes
- Rav discards a failed matir
- Reish Lakish requires a replacement
- Rabbi validates it fully
- "Mimashkei Yisrael" allows temporary prohibition
- Mechusar zman *within the day* is acceptable
- Order matters only in true avodah
- Shechitah is not order-sensitive
- Kodshim are discarded respectfully
- Treifah needed explicit Torah exclusion

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל