Menachos 28 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Shalom Shelo Lishmah vs Shelo L'Shemah – Intent in the Heichal

The daf opens by comparing:

- **Avodah done with incorrect intent** (*שלא לשמה*)
- **Avodah done incorrectly in direction or designation**

We contrast:

- The **first Mishnah in Menachos**
- With the **first Mishnah in Zevachim**

In Zevachim:

- Certain korbanos done **שלא לשמה** are **פסול**
- Others are **כשר but do not bring כפרה**

A seeming contradiction arises from a Beraisa:

- It implies that even without correct intent, the avodah can still be valid

---

2️⃣ One Hekesh — Not Two

Resolution:

- There is a **hekesh** between **חטאת** and **אשם**
- But a critical rule applies in Kodshim:

A hekesh that is learned cannot teach further

So:

- You may learn from **אשם** → **חטאת**
- But not from **אשם** → **another korban**

This explains:

- Why intent is required for some korbanos
- But not extended universally

3️⃣ Kapparah vs Eating the Shirayim

Key distinction:

- **Kashrus of the korban ≠ effectiveness of kapparah**

Thus:

- A korban may be:
    - **כשר**(technically valid)
    - Yet require the owner to bring **another korban** for kapparah

This resolves the contradiction:

- One source discusses **eating**
- The other discusses **atonement**

4️⃣ Menorah – Seven Branches Are Ma'akev

A major new sugya begins: **the Menorah**.

Rules:

- The Menorah must have **seven branches**
- If even **one branch is missing** → **פסול**

Similarly:

- Each lamp (נר) must exist
- Missing one invalidates the entire Menorah

Source:

- The Torah uses terms of **חוקה / הוויה**
- And repetition, making them **מעכב**

5️⃣ Parallel Examples – Absolute Requirements

The Mishnah lists several cases where **one missing invalidates all**:

- **Mezuzah**:
    - Missing one parsha → פסול
    - Missing even one letter → פסול
- **Tefillin**:

- Missing one parsha → **פסול**

- **Arba Minim**:
  - Must all be present to fulfill the mitzvah
    (each opinion defines whether they are one mitzvah or multiple)

Common thread:

When the Torah defines a structure as a unit,
every component becomes indispensable.

6️⃣ Why Is the Menorah So Strict?

Answer:

- The Torah repeatedly uses **לשון הוויה**
- And describes the Menorah as:
  - **מִקְשָׁה אַחַת**— one solid piece

Thus:

- Structure, number, and form are all **מעכב**

7️⃣ Mikshah – One Solid Piece Only for Gold

Critical distinction:

- If the Menorah is made of **gold**:
  - It must be **mikshah** (hammered from one piece)
- If made of **other metals**:
  - It does **not** need to be mikshah

Source:

- The word **מִקְשָׁה**appears multiple times
- Repetition → **לעכב**

8️⃣ Which Materials Are Kosher for the Menorah?

Machlokes Tannaim:

- **Rabbi Yehudah**:
    - Only **metal**
    - Wood is **פסול**
- **Rabbi Yosi**:
    - Even **wood** is kosher

Underlying dispute:

- How to read the pesukim:
    - **Klal–Prat–Klal**
    - Or **Ribui–Miut–Ribui**

If learned as Klal–Prat–Klal:

- Only materials similar to **gold** → metals

If learned as Ribui–Miut:

- Everything is included
- Only **earthenware** is excluded

9️⃣ Proof from History – The Chashmonaim's Menorah

Historical support:

- The Chashmonaim used a **non-gold Menorah**
- Temporarily made from other materials

This supports the view:

- That **gold is ideal**
- But **not always required**

🔟 The Prohibition of Making a Seven-Branched Menorah

Another halacha:

- One may **not** make a seven-branched Menorah for personal use
- Even from other metals

Why?

- It resembles the כלי המקדש

This is why modern candelabras:

- Have **six, eight, or more** branches — but not seven

1️⃣1️⃣ Gaviyim, Kaftorim, and Perachim

The Menorah's decorations:

- **22 cups (גביעים)**
- **11 knobs (כפתורים)**
- **9 flowers (פרחים)**

All are **מעכב**:

- Missing even one → פסול

The Gemara derives each number precisely from pesukim:

- 3 cups per branch × 6 branches = 18
- Plus 4 on the center shaft = 22

1️⃣2️⃣ Exact Structure Matters

The Menorah:

- Was a single integrated design
- Each height, ornament, and division measured exactly

Even small deviations:

Require starting over from scratch.

This highlights:

- The extreme **precision** required in Mikdash vessels

✨ Takeaway – Menachos 28

- Intent determines **kapparah**, not always validity
- A hekesh may teach only **one step**
- The Menorah is an **absolute structure**

- Seven branches are indispensable
- Gold Menorah must be mikshah ie from 1 block of gold
- Other metals may be used in certain circumstances
- Decorative elements are halachically essential
- Mikdash vessels demand total precision

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל