Menachos 23 – Good Morning Raboisai

---

1 Minchas Chotei – A Flour Offering Without Oil

The daf opens with **Minchas Chotei** (מִנְחַת חוֹטֵא) — a korban brought by someone who sinned but cannot afford an animal.

Key feature:

- It is brought **without oil and without frankincense**
- As the Torah states explicitly:
  "לֹא יָשִׂים עָלֶיהָ שֶׁמֶן וְלֹא יִתֵּן עָלֶיהָ לְבֹנָה"

Question:

- If no oil is allowed, how can it be prepared in a kli that already absorbed oil from previous Menachos?

---

2 Residual Oil in the Vessel

The Gemara explains:

- The vessel used for a Minchas Chotei may contain **absorbed oil**
- This is permitted because:
  - The oil is not being *added*
  - It is only **בלוע**(absorbed)

However:

- Actively **adding oil** — even a small amount — invalidates the Minchah

This preserves the Torah's requirement of a **dry Minchah** (מִנְחָה חֲרֵבָה).

---

3 "Dry" vs "Moist" Minchos – Not Always What You Think

The Gemara discusses a case of:

- A **"dry" Minchah** mixing with a **"moist" Minchah**

Important clarification:

- "Dry" does **not always** mean *no oil*
- Sometimes it means **relatively less oil**

Example:

- Minchas sheep vs Minchas cow
    - Sheep Minchah has **more oil per issaron**
    - Cow Minchah has **less oil per issaron**

Thus:

One Minchah can be called "חֲרֵבָה" only *relative* to another

---

4 Oil Absorption and פסול

If two Menachos mix:

- Oil transfers between them
- One ends up with too much oil
- The other with too little

Result:

Both become פסול, since each now deviates from its required shiur

This does **not** prove anything about Minchas Chotei, since that case involves **relative oil**, not total absence of oil.

---

5 Squeezing Oil from the Kemitzah

A key question:

- If oil is squeezed out of a **קומץ** and placed separately
- Then the flour is placed back onto the oil

Are they still considered one unit?

This parallels another famous machlokes:

- **Meat + bone** combining to form a כזית for liability
- Can two elements combine after partial separation?

The issue:

Does physical separation break halachic unity?

The Gemara leaves the conceptual comparison in place and moves on.

---

6 Two Menachos Touching Before Kemitzah

Case:

- Two Menachos are touching at one point
- Kemitzah has not yet been taken

Rule:

- If each can still have its **own independent קומץ**, it is valid
- One takes a קומץ from each separately

But if they are **too mixed**:

- You cannot ensure each has its own Kemitzah
- Both become invalid

---

7 Kemitzah Falling Into Another Minchah

Case 1:

- A valid Kemitzah falls into another Minchah **before** its Kemitzah
- The Kemitzah may not be burned
- But if it was burned — it works בדיעבד
- The second Minchah must be brought again

Case 2:

- A Kemitzah falls back into its own **שיריים**
- This violates **"לא תקטירו"**
- But again: if burned, it is valid בדיעבד

---

8 Majority vs Minority – Rav Chisda vs Rav Chanina

Core machlokes:

- **Rav Chisda**: We follow the **majority** (מבטל)
- **Rav Chanina**: We focus on the **minority** (בטל)

Key principle:

- We ask: *Can one entity ever change into the other?*

Examples:

- **Shechutah meat** can never become Neveilah
- **Neveilah** can lose tumah when it decomposes

This determines whether the mixture is:

- **מין במינו**(not batel)
- Or **מין בשאינו מינו**(batel)

9️⃣ Application to Menachos

This framework explains why:

- One Minchah does **not** cancel another
- Even when parts mix, Kemitzah may still be taken
- Because Minchos are treated like **kodshim**, where:
    - Similar items do not nullify each other

The Mishnah's ruling fits this logic precisely.

✨ Takeaway – Menachos 23

- **Minchas Chotei** must remain completely oil-free
- Absorbed oil is permitted; added oil is not
- "Dry" vs "moist" is sometimes relative, not absolute
- Oil transfer between Menachos can invalidate both
- Separation affects halachic unity
- Kemitzah errors may still work בדיעבד
- Majority/minority rules depend on *potential for change*
- Kodshim do not cancel each other like regular mixtures

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל