Menachos 18 – Good Morning Raboisai

---

1 Achilah Shelo K'darkah — Eating the Wrong Thing the Wrong Way

We begin with the Mishnah's case of **אֲכִילָה שֶׁלֹּא כְּדַרְכָּהּ**:

- The **קֻמִּיצָה** is meant to be burned on the מִזְבֵּחַ
- The **שְׁיָרִים** are meant to be eaten by the כֹּהֲנִים

What if the Kohen thinks:

- "I'll **eat** the kometz tomorrow" (instead of burning it), or
- "I'll **burn** the shirayim" (instead of eating them)?

This is a מחשבה that reverses the Torah's intended mode of consumption.

---

2 Is There Pigul and Kares?

The Gemara clarifies an important distinction:

- **Everyone agrees**:
  There is **no כרת** for such a thought
- The dispute is only:
  - **Kasher**
  - **Pasul**
  - Or something in between

Because:

Pigul requires a מחשבה **בְּדֶרֶךְ הָאֲכִילָה הַנְּכוֹנָה**
A מחשבה that switches eater and consumed item is fundamentally flawed.

---

3 Machshavah About Leaving Blood Overnight

We now shift to another sugya:

What if a Kohen thinks:

- "I will leave the **דם** overnight" (חוץ לזמנו)

But in reality:

- He **does not** leave it overnight

Here we find **three shittos**:

1. **Kosher**
2. **Posul**
3. **Machlokes Tannaim**

The key principle:

- Since **physically leaving blood overnight** is פסול,
- Thinking about doing so may or may not invalidate — depending on the Tanna

---

4 The Famous Story: Yosef HaBavli

A powerful narrative illustrates love of Torah:

Yosef HaBavli repeatedly asks Rebbe:

Is a thought to leave blood overnight **kasher or pasul**?

- Night → Kosher
- Morning → Kosher
- Afternoon → Kosher
- **Mincha → "Kosher, except according to Rebbi Eliezer (Pasul)"**

Yosef HaBavli is overjoyed.

Why?
He once heard a view that it was **posul**, and now he finally found a **Tanna** who agrees.

Rebbe responds emotionally:

אַשְׁרֵיהֶם לְתַלְמִידֵי חֲכָמִים
שֶׁדִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה חֲבִיבִים עֲלֵיהֶם יוֹתֵר מִכֹּל

This story becomes a יסוד in how Chazal view **persistent, passionate Torah seeking**.

---

5 The Steps of the Minchah — Which Are Ma'akev?

The Mishnah lists multiple stages of the Minchah:

- **יְצִיקָה**– pouring oil

- **בְּלִילָה**– mixing
- **פְּתִיתָה**– breaking into pieces
- **מְלִיחָה**– salting
- **תְּנוּפָה**– waving
- **הַגָּשָׁה**– bringing to the corner of the מזבח

Rule:

- If these were done **by a Yisrael instead of a Kohen** → **Kosher**
- But if they were **not done at all** → some are **Ma'akev**

---

6 Shana Alav HaKasuv Le'akev

A core yesod reappears:

In **Kodshim**, when the Torah **repeats** a requirement, it becomes **מעכב**

Thus:

- Certain oil applications **must** be done
- The Mishnah's wording ("לא יצק") means:
  - A **Yisrael** did it, not that it was skipped

Otherwise it would be invalid.

---

7 Bila — Mixing That Is Required Only If Possible

The Gemara introduces a famous rule:

כָּל הָרָאוּי לְבִילָה — אֵין הַבִּילָה מְעַכֶּבֶת

If:

- The Minchah **could have been mixed**, even if it wasn't → **Kosher**
  But if:
- It was **too large to mix** (e.g. more than 60 עשרונים) → **Posul**

Ability matters more than execution.

---

8 Petitah — Large Pieces vs No Breaking

A subtle distinction:

- **Not breaking at all** → Kasher
- **Breaking incorrectly into oversized pieces (פִּיתָּה מְרוּבָּה)** → Pasul

Why?
Because once you begin an avodah, it must be done **properly**.

9️⃣ Which Avodos Require a Kohen?

The Gemara lists **15 Avodos** exclusive to Kohanim, including:

- Kemitzah
- Haktarah
- Melikah
- Kabbalas HaDam
- Hazayah
- Nesias Kapayim

But crucial rule:

- A Kohen who **denies** an avodah does **not** receive its benefits

---

🔟 Minchas Kohen vs Minchas Yisrael

Final distinction:

- **Minchas Yisrael**:
    - Everything **before kemitzah** → can be done by a Yisrael
- **Minchas Kohen** (entirely burned):
    - Requires a Kohen **from beginning to end**

This resolves the apparent contradiction between the Mishnah and other sources.

✨ Takeaway – Menachos 18

- Pigul requires **correct mode of consumption**
- Machshavah shelo k'darkah lacks kares

- Passion for Torah is celebrated above all
- Ability (ראוי) defines halachic validity
- In Kodshim, **precision matters**
- Avodah roles depend on **who the Minchah belongs to**

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל