Menachos 17 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Pigul "Atom by Atom" — Shumshum le-Shumshum

The daf opens with a striking case:

A Kohen performs **kemitzah**, and while doing so he thinks:

- "I will eat the shirayim **tomorrow**" (חוץ לזמן)

But instead of one unified thought, he does it:

- **Shumshum le-shumshum** — sesame seed by sesame seed
- Each tiny unit is intended separately, until the **entire kemitzah** is covered

Question:

Do many microscopic pigul thoughts **combine** into full pigul?

Three opinions:

1. **Pigul** – full pigul with כרת
2. **Pasul** – invalid, but no כרת
3. **Kasher** – completely valid

2️⃣ Linking the Opinions to Known Shittos

The Gemara attempts to align each view:

- **Pigul** → possibly **Rabbi Meir**
  (who allows pigul with **chatzi matir**)
- **Pasul** → possibly **Chachamim**
  (who require a **full matir**)
- **Kasher** → possibly **Rebbi**
  (who rejects pigul when intent is fragmented)

But the Gemara pushes back:

- Maybe **even Rabbi Meir** would reject this case
- Because **each sesame seed is not a shiur**

This sugya forces a deeper clarification.

3️⃣ Kemitzah and Levonah — Revisiting Two Matirim

Reminder:

- Shirayim are permitted only after:
    1. **Kemitzah**
    2. **Levonah**

These are **two matirim**.

Key distinction:

- Thinking about shirayim during **kemitzah**
  ≠
- Thinking about levonah during kemitzah

This leads to a major dispute.

4️⃣ Can One Haktarah Create Pigul for Another?

Chareiva d'Pumbedisa suggests:

Haktarah mefagelet haktarah
One burning can create pigul for another

Example:

- While burning **kemitzah**, the Kohen thinks:
    - "I'll burn the **levonah** tomorrow"

This would create pigul — even though they are **two matirim**.

This is a major chiddush and highly controversial.

5️⃣ Strong Rejection — Rav Ashi / Ravina

Rav Ashi (in the name of Ravina) rejects this sharply:

Rule:

Ein haktarah mefagelet haktarah

Reason:

- Kemitzah is **not** the matir for levonah

- Levonah is **not** the matir for kemitzah
- Both only permit **shira yim**

Therefore:

- You cannot jump from one matir to the other
- Pigul works **only** from matir → permitted item

---

6 Why the Two Sheep of Shavuos Are Different

Proof:

- Two sheep of Shavuos
- Pigul in sheep #1 does **not** affect sheep #2

Why?

- One sheep is not matir the other
- Both only permit the **bread**

So too:

- Kemitzah and levonah cannot create pigul for each other

---

7 One Kli vs Two — A Critical Distinction

Chareiva d'Pumbedisa tried to argue:

- Kemitzah and levonah begin in **one kli**
- Therefore they are more connected

Answer:

- Physical proximity does **not** create halachic matir-status
- Matir relationships are **functional**, not spatial

---

8 Machshavah Shelo K'derech

Another axis of the sugya:

If a Kohen thinks:

- To **eat** something that is normally burned
  (e.g. kemitzah or levonah)

This is:

- **Shelo k'derech**
- Does **not** create pigul with כרת

At most:

- **Pasul**, depending on the Tanna

9️⃣ Eating vs Mizbeach "Eating"

Key yesod reinforced:

- There are **two forms of achilah**:
  1. Human eating
  2. Mizbeach "eating" (haktarah)

Pigul can apply across these categories **only** when:

- The item is the **direct matir** for the other

Otherwise:

- They do not combine

🔟 Final Clarification — Why Shumshum Fails

Returning to the sesame-seed case:

Even though:

- Eventually every part was included

Since:

- No **single unified shiur**
- No **direct matir relationship**
- Fragmented, unnatural machshavah

Conclusion:

Shumshum le-shumshum does not create full pigul

At best:

- The Minchah may be **pasul**
- Or even **kasher**, depending on the shittah

✨ **Takeaway – Menachos 17**

- Pigul requires **halachic unity**, not atomic intent
- Fragmented thoughts do not combine automatically
- One matir cannot create pigul for another matir
- Physical closeness (same kli) is irrelevant
- Pigul follows **functional relationships**
- Achilah and haktarah only combine where the Torah links them
- Precision in **structure of avodah** defines pigul

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל