Chullin 142 – Good Morning Raboisai

The Final Daf of Maseches Chullin

1️⃣ Taking the Mother Before the Young

👉 The Mishnah teaches:

If someone takes the mother bird while she is still on the young:

Rebbe Yehudah says:

- He receives Malkus.
- He must still send the mother away.

The Chachamim say:

- He sends the mother away.
- He does not receive Malkus.

The Machlokes depends on how we understand the relationship between:

- לא תקח האם על הבנים – do not take the mother with the young.
- שלח תשלח – you must send away the mother. 142_transcript

Lav HaNitak L'Aseh

2️⃣ The Chachamim – The Aseh Corrects the Lav

👉 According to the Chachamim:

If he violated the Lav and took the mother:

- The Torah gives him a way to correct it.

He must now:

- Send the mother away.

This is a:

- Lav HaNitak L'Aseh – a Lav followed by an Aseh which provides a correction.

Therefore:

- He does not receive Malkus if he fulfils the Aseh.

3️⃣ Why Does Rebbe Yehudah Give Malkus?

👉 The Gemara investigates whether Rebbe Yehudah holds generally that:

- One receives Malkus even for a Lav HaNitak L'Aseh.

Or perhaps:

- Normally he agrees there is no Malkus.

Shiluach HaKen is different because Rebbe Yehudah understands:

- שלח תשלח as the original Mitzvah.

In other words:

- First send the mother.
- Do not take her together with the young.

It is not merely:

- A correction after violating the Lav.

4️⃣ Proof From Peah and Shikchah

👉 The Gemara discusses someone who violated the Torah's laws of:

- Peah
- Or Shikchah

and took produce which should have been:

- Left for the poor.

Here too the Torah says:

- תעזב אותם – leave them.

Although this appears to be an Aseh following the Lav, Rebbe Yehudah's position there does not prove that every:

- Lav HaNitak L'Aseh

receives Malkus.

Why?

Because תעזב אותם can also be understood as:

- The original instruction – leave it there in the first place.

5️⃣ Nosar Proves the Rule

👉 The clearer proof comes from:

- Nosar.

The Torah prohibits:

- Leaving Korban meat beyond its permitted time.

If some was left over:

- It must be burned.

Here the Aseh of burning it can only happen:

- After the Lav was violated.

Rebbe Yehudah agrees there is:

- No Malkus.

This proves that generally:

- Rebbe Yehudah agrees a genuine Lav HaNitak L'Aseh does not receive Malkus.

Shiluach HaKen is different because:

- שלח תשלח is the original command, not merely a repair.

How Far Must the Mother Be Sent?

6️⃣ She Must Actually Fly Away

👉 The Gemara asks:

How far must the mother be sent?

The answer is:

- Until she leaves his control.

Could she simply:

- Walk away?

No.

A bird's normal means of movement is:

- Its wings.

Therefore:

- She must be capable of flying away.

7️⃣ The Man Who Cut the Bird's Wings

👉 A man cut the wings of the mother bird and then:

- Sent her away.

Rebbe Yehudah placed him in:

- Cherem.

He told him to:

- Wait for the wings to grow back
- And then properly send her away.

The Gemara explains that the punishment involved here was:

- Rabbinic enforcement

rather than the Torah Malkus of the Mishnah.

The Tima Bird

8️⃣ Even One Egg Is Enough

👉 A person asked Rava about performing Shiluach HaKen with:

- A bird called a Tima.

Rava realized the man's uncertainty may have been because:

- This bird lays only one egg.

Rava told him:

- Yes, Shiluach HaKen applies.

This confirms what we learned:

- Even one egg is enough.

9️⃣ Rava Caught the Mother

👉 After the man sent the bird away:

- Rava caught it.

The Gemara discusses how this fits with the ownership status of birds that:

- Nest around people's homes.

They may not actually belong to the homeowner:

- On a Torah level.

Nevertheless, taking them can still create an issue of:

- Darkei Shalom – maintaining peaceful relations.

When Does Your Chatzer Acquire the Eggs?

🔟 Eggs on Your Property Aren't Automatically Yours

👉 Suppose wild pigeons lay eggs:

- On your roof
- In your attic
- Or on your property.

One might think:

- Your Chatzer automatically acquires them.

But there is an important rule:

Your Chatzer can only acquire something for you when:

- You yourself could Halachically acquire it.

While the mother is still sitting on the eggs:

- You are forbidden to take them.

Therefore:

- Your Chatzer cannot acquire them for you at that point.

1️⃣1️⃣ Once the Mother Is Sent Away

👉 Once the mother is:

- Properly sent away

the prohibition against taking the eggs is removed.

Now:

- You could personally take them.

Therefore:

- Your Chatzer can acquire them.

This explains the difference between:

- Actual Gezel

and merely:

- Darkei Shalom.

1️⃣2️⃣ The Case of a Minor

👉 The Gemara ultimately establishes one of the cases as involving:

- A child.

The child himself does not have the same Mitzvah obligation.

Nevertheless:

- His father may have to return what was taken

because of:

- Darkei Shalom.

Making the Birds Acquirable

1️⃣3️⃣ Levi and Shmuel

👉 Levi transferred young birds to Rav Yehudah, who came to Shmuel.

Shmuel advised:

- Make noise at the nest so the mother birds fly away.

Why?

Once the mothers leave:

- The restriction of Shiluach HaKen is removed.

The owner can then:

- Acquire the young

and afterward:

- Transfer them to someone else.

The point of making the birds fly was therefore not the actual transfer to the buyer.

It was to enable:

- The original owner to acquire them first.

The Reward for Shiluach HaKen

1️⃣4️⃣ A “Mitzvah Kalah”

👉 The Mishnah describes Shiluach HaKen as:

- A relatively easy Mitzvah.

Yet the Torah promises:

- למען ייטב לך והארכת ימים – it will be good for you and your days will be lengthened.

The Mishnah makes a Kal VaChomer:

If such a Mitzvah has such great reward:

- How much more so other Mitzvos.

Kibbud Av VaEm + Shiluach HaKen

1️⃣5️⃣ Two Mitzvos Promising Long Life

👉 The Gemara presents a powerful case.

A father tells his son:

- Climb up
- Perform Shiluach HaKen
- And bring me the young.

The son is now performing:

- Kibbud Av VaEm
- Shiluach HaKen.

Both Mitzvos are associated in the Torah with:

- Arichas Yomim.

Yet the son:

- Falls from the ladder and dies.

How can that happen?

The Reward Is in Olam HaBa

1️⃣6️⃣ “Long Life” Doesn't Necessarily Mean This World

👉 Rebbe Yaakov explains:

The Torah's promise means:

- למען ייטב לך – in the world which is entirely good.
- והארכת ימים – in the world which is entirely long.

Meaning:

- Olam HaBa.

The Torah is not promising that every person who performs these Mitzvos:

- Will necessarily live longer in this world.

The true reward for Mitzvos is:

- Beyond this world.

1️⃣7️⃣ Rebbe Yaakov Saw It Happen

👉 Perhaps the entire case is only theoretical?

No.

Rebbe Yaakov:

- Personally witnessed such an event.

He saw someone fulfil these Mitzvos and:

- Die afterward.

This led him to understand that the Torah's promise of reward refers fundamentally to:

- Olam HaBa.

Perhaps He Was Thinking About an Aveirah?

1️⃣8️⃣ Bad Thoughts Normally Don't Cancel a Mitzvah

👉 The Gemara asks:

Perhaps while performing the Mitzvah the person was:

- Thinking about committing an Aveirah.

The Gemara answers with the principle:

- Machshavah Ra'ah is generally not joined to an action.

A person's improper thought does not simply:

- Cancel the Mitzvah he is actually performing.

1️⃣9️⃣ Avodah Zarah Is Different

👉 Perhaps he was thinking about:

- Avodah Zarah.

That is more serious because:

- Thoughts of Avodah Zarah can themselves have Halachic significance.

But the Gemara still argues:

If Mitzvah reward existed in this world:

- The Mitzvah should at least have protected him from such a downfall.

The conclusion remains:

- שכר מצוה בהאי עלמא ליכא.

The ultimate reward for a Mitzvah is:

- Not in this world.

Doesn't a Mitzvah Protect a Person?

2️⃣0️⃣ The Dangerous Ladder

👉 The Gemara asks:

Don't we have a principle that someone going to perform a Mitzvah is:

- Protected from harm?

The answer:

- The ladder was dangerous and unstable.

One may not rely on a miracle when:

- There is an obvious danger.

A Mitzvah does not give permission to:

- Put yourself into a dangerous situation.

Acher

2️⃣1️⃣ What Caused Acher to Go Off the Derech?

👉 Rav Yosef says:

Had Acher properly understood this teaching of:

- Rebbe Yaakov

he might not have:

- Gone off the Derech.

Acher witnessed an event where someone performed:

- Kibbud Av VaEm
- Shiluach HaKen

and nevertheless:

- Died.

He could not reconcile what he saw with:

- The Torah's promise of long life.

2️⃣2️⃣ The Tongue of a Talmid Chacham

👉 The Gemara also relates another devastating sight associated with Acher.

He saw:

- The tongue of a great Torah scholar lying disgracefully in the street.

He wondered:

How could the mouth which produced:

- So much Torah

meet such an end?

These experiences contributed to:

- His spiritual crisis.

Had he understood that the Torah's ultimate reward is:

- Olam HaBa

the events would not have contradicted:

- The Torah's promise.

📌 Key Chazarah

- Rebbe Yehudah says one who takes the mother receives Malkus; the Chachamim treat Shale'ach Teshalach as the Aseh correcting the Lav.
- Rebbe Yehudah agrees that a genuine Lav HaNitak L'Aseh normally does not receive Malkus; Shiluach HaKen is different because he understands Shale'ach Teshalach as the original command.
- The mother must be properly sent away and able to fly.
- Even one egg is enough for Shiluach HaKen.
- A person's Chatzer cannot acquire the eggs while he himself is forbidden to take them.
- Once the mother is sent away, the eggs can become acquirable.
- The Torah promises Arichas Yomim for Shiluach HaKen.
- The Gemara's case combines Shiluach HaKen with Kibbud Av VaEm, yet the son falls from the ladder and dies.
- Rebbe Yaakov explains that the Torah's ultimate promise of "good" and "long life" refers to Olam HaBa.
- Schar Mitzvah BeHai Alma Leka – the ultimate reward for Mitzvos is not in this world.
- A person performing a Mitzvah is protected, but not where there is an obvious danger.
- Acher's failure to understand this principle contributed to his spiritual downfall.

Hadran Alach Maseches Chullin!

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל