Chullin 129 – Good Morning Raboisai

Flesh Cut From Eiver Min HaChai

1️⃣ When Does the Flesh Become Tamei?

👉 The Gemara continues with flesh cut from a limb that had come from a living animal.

There are two possibilities:

- If the flesh was cut first and only afterwards designated as food, it is tahor.
- If it was first designated as food and then cut, it becomes tamei with Tum'as Ochlin.

Why?

Because before being cut:

- The flesh was touching the Eiver Min HaChai, which is an Av HaTumah.

Once it already had the status of food:

- That contact can give it Tum'as Ochlin.

Tum'as Beis HaSetarim

2️⃣ But the Contact Was Hidden!

👉 The Gemara asks a major question.

When two pieces are joined and then cut apart:

- The actual point where they were touching was hidden inside.

This is called:

- Beis HaSetarim – a concealed area of contact.

Normally:

- Tumah through hidden contact does not transmit Tumah.

So how did the flesh become tamei from the Eiver Min HaChai?

3️⃣ Rebbe Meir and Hidden Contact

👉 Rebbe Zeira relates that he had this question and asked Rebbe Abba Mamal.

The answer:

- The Mishnah can follow Rebbe Meir.

Rebbe Meir holds in certain circumstances:

- Tum'as Beis HaSetarim can transmit Tumah.

However, the Gemara qualifies this:

- Where the food still requires Hechsher, the issue is more complicated.

4️⃣ The Case Where It Already Had Hechsher

👉 The Gemara therefore establishes the case where:

- The flesh had already received Hechsher
- And was already susceptible to Tumah.

Now the concealed contact with the Eiver Min HaChai:

- Can make it tamei according to Rebbe Meir.

Tumah Chamurah

5️⃣ Why Should Hechsher Be Necessary?

👉 Rabbah bar Rav Chana asks:

Why should we need Hechsher at all?

Eiver Min HaChai has:

- Tumah Chamurah – severe Tumah.

📌 What Is Tumah Chamurah?

Here it means Tumah capable of making:

- A person
- Or keilim

tamei.

This is the level of:

- Av HaTumah.

By contrast, ordinary Tum'as Ochlin:

- Cannot make a person or keilim tamei.

Normally, something associated with Tumah Chamurah:

- Does not require the ordinary Hechsher process.

Panim Chadashos Ba'u L'Kan

6️⃣ "When It Served the Dead, It Was Wood"

👉 The Gemara answers with an important principle:

- K'sheshi'meish ma'aseh eitz shimeish.

When this object previously served in its original role:

- It was not functioning as food.

Only afterwards:

- Its designation changed
- And it became food.

Rashi summarizes the idea:

- Panim Chadashos ba'u l'kan.

👉 It now has a new halachic identity.

Therefore:

- Its previous exposure to Tumah Chamurah does not automatically give its newly created food-status the same Tumah.

Several Examples of the Same Principle

7️⃣ Food Designated as a Seat

👉 Abaye gives an example.

Someone has:

- A large piece of food

and permanently designates it:

- For sitting.

A Zav then sits on it.

Normally, food cannot reach:

- Tum’as Midras.

But here it can.

Why?

Because once designated as a seat:

- It is no longer functioning as food.
- It is functioning as an object or chair.

So this is not proof that ordinary food can receive Tumah Chamurah.

It is:

- Panim Chadashos ba’u l’kan.

8️⃣ Food Used for Avodah Zarah

👉 Another example is:

- Food which becomes part of Avodah Zarah.

Avodah Zarah can have an extremely severe Tumah, including:

- Tum’as Ohel according to the relevant opinion.

Does this prove food can receive Tumah Chamurah?

No.

Once it functions as:

- Avodah Zarah

its previous food identity is no longer controlling.

Again:

- K’sheshi'meish ma’aseh eitz shimeish.

9️⃣ Dough Used to Repair a Kli

👉 Another example:

- Dough is used to plug a hole in a vessel.

Once it becomes part of the kli:

- It takes on the status of the vessel.

If that vessel receives severe Tumah:

- The dough can share its status.

But again:

- It is no longer functioning as food.
- It is functioning as part of the kli.

🔟 Fat Protecting a Kidney

👉 The Gemara discusses:

- Fat surrounding a kidney.

The fat can function as:

- A shomer – protection for the kidney.

Although it could potentially be food:

- While functioning as a shomer it has a different halachic role.

Only later, if designated as food:

- It receives its new identity.

Again:

- Panim Chadashos ba'u l'kan.

1️⃣1️⃣ Grain Used as a Roof

👉 Rav Masna gives another example.

If grain or similar produce is designated:

- As roofing material

it is no longer functioning as food.

If the house subsequently receives:

- Tum'as Tzaraas

the roofing can participate in that severe Tumah.

This does not prove ordinary food can become an Av HaTumah.

Why?

Because as part of the roof:

- It is functioning as building material.

📌 The Common Principle

All these cases teach the same point:

An object may begin as:

- Food

but then acquire a completely different halachic identity.

Its later status is judged according to:

- What it is functioning as now.

Rebbe Shimon Says Tahor

1️⃣2️⃣ Which Part of the Mishnah Is He Discussing?

👉 The Mishnah ended:

- Rebbe Shimon metaher – Rebbe Shimon says it is tahor.

The Gemara now asks:

Exactly which case is Rebbe Shimon referring to?

Several possibilities are considered.

Possibility 1 – The Beginning of the Mishnah

1️⃣3️⃣ A Dangling Limb Touched by a Sheretz

👉 Perhaps Rebbe Shimon refers to:

- A limb dangling from a living animal
- Which was touched by a sheretz.

The Tanna Kamma says:

- It can receive Tum'as Ochlin.

Perhaps Rebbe Shimon says:

- Tahor.

Why?

Because to be food it must be:

- Something permitted for consumption by someone.

But this dangling limb:

- Cannot yet be eaten even by a non-Jew because of Eiver Min HaChai.

Therefore:

- It lacks the necessary food status.

1️⃣4️⃣ But Why Need a Special Reason?

👉 The Gemara challenges this.

Perhaps the reason it is tahor is much simpler:

- It is still attached to the animal.

We have already seen by a damaged branch:

- If it remains sufficiently connected to survive, it is still considered attached.

So perhaps no special rule about:

- Edibility

is needed.

The Gemara therefore considers another part of the Mishnah.

Possibility 2 – After Shechita

1️⃣5️⃣ The Shechita Blood

👉 Perhaps Rebbe Shimon refers to the middle case:

- The animal was shechted
- While the limb remained dangling.

The Tanna Kamma says:

- The Shechita blood provides Hechsher.

Rebbe Shimon says:

- Tahor.

Again, perhaps because:

- The dangling limb cannot be eaten.

1️⃣6️⃣ But Yesterday We Had Other Explanations

👉 The Gemara rejects this as necessary.

Yesterday we learned several explanations for:

- Rebbe Meir and Rebbe Shimon's disagreement.

For example:

- Whether such a weak connection counts
- Whether the large animal can serve as a Yad for the small limb
- Whether Yad works for Hechsher
- And when Shechita takes effect.

Therefore:

- We do not need to say Rebbe Shimon's reason here is the edibility requirement.

Possibility 3 – The End of the Mishnah

1️⃣7️⃣ The Animal Dies

👉 The Gemara therefore returns to the end of the Mishnah.

The animal:

- Dies

while the limb or flesh is still dangling.

We have learned the principle:

- Misah osah nefilah.

Death itself creates:

- Halachic separation.

But this produces an obvious problem.

1️⃣8️⃣ A Limb Is Tamei Either Way

👉 If we are discussing a complete limb:

If it is viewed as separating immediately before death:

- It is Eiver Min HaChai.

If it remains attached until after death:

- It is Eiver Min HaNeveilah.

Either way:

- It has Tumah.

So how can Rebbe Shimon simply say:

- Tahor?

The Answer – We Are Discussing Flesh

1️⃣9️⃣ Basar Is Different From an Eiver

👉 The Gemara answers:

Rebbe Shimon is not discussing:

- A complete limb.

He is discussing:

- Basar – flesh.

This makes a major difference.

Ordinary flesh removed from a living animal:

- Does not have Tum'as Eiver Min HaChai.

Therefore, if:

- Misah osah nefilah

and the flesh is viewed as separating just before death:

- It separated while the animal was alive.

It is therefore:

- Basar Min HaChai
- Not Basar Min HaNeveilah.

That explains why Rebbe Shimon can say:

- Tahor.

2️⃣0️⃣ It Still Needs Hechsher

👉 Since this flesh is not itself carrying Tumah Chamurah:

- It needs ordinary Hechsher before it can receive Tum'as Ochlin.

This explains the Mishnah's distinction between:

- A dangling Eiver
- And dangling Basar.

A Dangling Limb of a Person

2️⃣1️⃣ The Mishnah Discusses a Human Being

👉 The Gemara brings a similar Mishnah regarding:

- A dangling limb or flesh of a person.

While the person is alive:

- The dangling flesh is tahor.

If the person dies:

- The flesh remains subject to the discussion of whether death creates separation.

A complete limb is different because:

- Eiver Min HaChai of a person itself has Tumah.

2️⃣2️⃣ Misah Osah Nefilah by a Person

👉 Again we apply:

- Misah osah nefilah.

The limb is viewed as:

- Halachically separating immediately before death.

Therefore it can retain the status of:

- Eiver Min HaChai

rather than becoming simply:

- Eiver Min HaMeis.

A Tiny Complete Limb

2️⃣3️⃣ Less Than a Kezayis

👉 The Gemara now discusses a very important case:

- A complete human limb
- Containing less than a kezayis of flesh.

Ordinarily:

- Flesh from a meis requires a kezayis for Tumah.

But a complete limb can have:

- Its own independent significance.

The question is whether this applies equally to:

- Eiver Min HaChai
- And Eiver Min HaMeis.

2️⃣4️⃣ Rebbe Eliezer's Tradition

👉 Rebbe Eliezer says:

- I heard that Eiver Min HaChai is tamei.

A possible implication is:

- Eiver Min HaMeis is not included in that particular teaching.

The Gemara challenges this strongly.

2️⃣5️⃣ The Kal Vachomer

👉 If a limb from:

- A living person

can transmit Tumah even when it is very small, then surely a limb from:

- A dead person

should transmit Tumah.

After all:

- The dead body itself has the more severe Tumah.

So logically:

- Eiver Min HaMeis should certainly be tamei.

The Pesach Sheni Comparison

2️⃣6️⃣ Can We Infer the Opposite?

👉 A comparison is brought from:

- Pesach Sheni.

If a source teaches that:

- A hesped should not be made on Pesach Sheni

we would not infer:

- That it is permitted on Pesach Rishon.

Quite the opposite:

- If it is prohibited on Pesach Sheni
- Certainly it is prohibited on the greater Yom Tov of Pesach Rishon.

Likewise here:

If Eiver Min HaChai is tamei:

- Certainly we might expect Eiver Min HaMeis to be tamei.

2️⃣7️⃣ “Kach Shamati”

👉 After hearing the argument, Rebbe Eliezer responds simply:

- Kach shamati – this is what I received.

In other words:

- This was not his own logical derivation.
- It was a received tradition from his Rebbe.

The Gemara highlights an important principle:

- A clear mesorah is not overturned merely because we have a seemingly powerful logical argument.

Kezayis Basar and Etzem K'Se'orah

2️⃣8️⃣ The Practical Difference

👉 The Gemara discusses the different components that can create Tumah:

- Kezayis Basar – an olive-sized amount of flesh
- Etzem k'se'orah – a bone the size of a barley grain.

These can produce different results depending on whether they came from:

- A living person
- Or a dead person.

This allows the Gemara to explain the machlokes without forcing Rebbe Shimon to be discussing:

- An ordinary Eiver Min HaMeis.

2️⃣9️⃣ Rebbe Shimon's Position

👉 The Gemara ultimately understands the dispute through:

- The different Tumah rules of Basar and Eiver
- And the different shiurim of flesh and bone.

The key point remains:

- A complete limb has a special halachic status
- Which is not identical to ordinary flesh.

Hadran Alach HaOr VeHaRotev

3️⃣0️⃣ Completing the Perek

👉 With this discussion, the Gemara completes the Perek:

Hadran Alach HaOr VeHaRotev.

The Perek has taken us through the detailed laws of:

- Tum'as Ochlin
- Yad and Shomer
- Neveilah
- Eiver Min HaChai
- Attached and detached flesh
- Maga, Masa and Ohel
- And the different levels of Tumah.

📌 Key Chazarah

- Flesh designated as food before being cut from Eiver Min HaChai can receive Tum'as Ochlin from the limb.
- The Gemara questions this because the contact occurs in a Beis HaSetarim – a hidden area.
- According to Rebbe Meir, hidden contact can transmit Tumah in the relevant circumstances.
- Tumah Chamurah means Tumah capable of making Adam or keilim tamei.
- "Panim Chadashos ba'u l'kan" means an object can acquire a new halachic identity when its function changes.
- The Gemara applies this to food used as a seat, Avodah Zarah, dough repairing a kli, fat protecting a kidney and grain used as roofing.
- Rebbe Shimon's statement of tahor is ultimately explained through the distinction between a complete Eiver and ordinary Basar.
- Misah osah nefilah means death creates the halachic separation of a dangling limb or flesh.
- Basar Min HaChai does not have the same Tumah as Eiver Min HaChai.

- A complete human limb can have special Tumah even when it contains less than a kezayis of flesh.
- The Gemara discusses whether the same rule applies to Eiver Min HaChai and Eiver Min HaMeis.
- Rebbe Eliezer responds to the logical challenge with “Kach shamati” – this is the tradition he received.
- Kezayis Basar and Etzem k’se’orah have different Tumah rules and help define the final machlokes.
- Hadran Alach HaOr VeHaRotev.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל