Chullin 125 – Good Morning Raboisai

Two Half-Kezaysim of Neveilah

1️⃣ Can Two Halves Combine for Maga?

👉 The Gemara continues the Mishnah's case of:

- Two separate half-kezaysim of neveilah
- Resting on the same hide.

Bar Pada explains:

If a person touches the hide from the side where:

- His contact effectively reaches both pieces simultaneously

The two halves can combine:

- Half + half = one full kezayis
- And he becomes tamei.

Rebbe Yochanan disagrees:

- Two separate half-kezaysim do not combine for Maga in this manner.

2️⃣ Rebbe Yishmael and Rebbe Dosa ben Harkinas

👉 Rebbe Yochanan connects this to another machlokes.

Rebbe Dosa ben Harkinas discusses:

- Two separate half-kezaysim of a meis
- Located inside the same Ohel.

Rebbe Dosa says:

- They do not combine to create Tumah throughout the Ohel.

The Chachamim say:

- They do combine.

This parallels our Mishnah:

- Rebbe Yishmael – two halves do not combine
- Rebbe Akiva – under the appropriate circumstances, they can combine.

3️⃣ But Doesn't Rebbe Akiva Agree?

👉 The Gemara asks:

In our Mishnah, Rebbe Akiva seemed to say:

- Two half-kezaysim on a hide do not combine.

So how can he correspond to:

- The Chachamim who say they do combine?

📌 Answer

The reason Rebbe Akiva rules tahor there is:

- The hide itself is mevatel the small pieces of meat.

But if the two halves were:

- Attached to a stick or toothpick

Where there is no bittul:

- Rebbe Akiva agrees that carrying them together can combine them.

Maga and Masa

4️⃣ Rebbe Akiva Links Maga to Masa

👉 The Gemara introduces an important principle.

Rebbe Akiva understands:

- Where Maga can apply, Masa can apply.
- Where Maga cannot apply, Masa does not apply either.

In other words:

- The ability to become tamei by carrying the neveilah can depend on whether that same Tumah is capable of creating Tumah through touching.

5️⃣ What If Maga Works from Only One Side?

👉 Bar Pada said that with two half-kezaysim:

- If you touch both pieces from the meat side
- They can combine for Maga.

So shouldn't that be enough to allow:

- Masa as well?

The Gemara explains:

- Rebbe Akiva requires Maga to be possible in the relevant manner generally.

If the arrangement prevents:

- Normal Maga from the other side of the hide

That limitation can prevent:

- Tumah through Masa as well.

The Femur Filled with Marrow

🩴 Rav Avya Sava's Question

👉 Rav Avya Sava asked Rabbah bar Rav Huna about:

- A kulis – a large femur bone
- Filled with edible marrow.

The marrow inside can have:

- The required amount of neveilah.

But the bone is:

- Completely sealed.

The question is:

If someone carries the sealed bone:

- Does he become tamei through Masa?

📌 The Svara

On one hand:

- He carried a full shiur of neveilah.

On the other:

- He cannot physically touch the marrow.

Perhaps the rule is:

- If there can be no Maga, there can be no Masa.

Or perhaps:

- That connection is only Rebbe Akiva's opinion
- While Rebbe Yishmael would allow Masa even without Maga.

"Look, a Bird!"

7️⃣ Rabbah bar Rav Huna Doesn't Answer

👉 Instead of answering the difficult question, Rabbah bar Rav Huna pointed away:

- "Look, a bird!"

His son was surprised.

He asked:

- You always praised Rav Avya as a great talmid chacham.
- Why avoid answering his question?

Rabbah bar Rav Huna explained:

- Ani hayom samchuni ba'ashiyos – today I am exhausted from the shiur and festivities.
- Rav Avya asked a question that requires real thought.

He was simply:

- Too mentally exhausted at that moment
- To properly analyse such a difficult question.

Ulla – Masa Requires One Unit

8️⃣ Two Halves on a Hide

👉 Ulla says:

If there are:

- Two separate half-kezaysim on a hide

Even if a person carries the entire hide:

- He remains tahor.

Why?

The Torah's wording regarding carrying neveilah is written in a way that can also be read:

- V'hanisa – “that which is carried.”

This teaches:

- The Tumah being carried must itself constitute one unit.

Two completely separate halves:

- Do not qualify.

9️⃣ What About Our Mishnah?

👉 But the Mishnah says that:

- Carrying two half-kezaysim together can cause Tumah.

How can Ulla explain this?

The Gemara answers:

- B'merudad.

The two pieces are:

- Connected by a thin strand of meat.

Therefore:

- They are not completely separate
- But constitute one connected unit.

🔟 Two Halves on a Toothpick

👉 The Gemara asks from another case:

- Two half-kezaysim are attached to a stick.
- Carrying the stick can make the person tamei.

Again:

- They appear to be two separate pieces.

According to Ulla, this too must be where:

- A thin strand connects the pieces
- Making them one unit for Masa.

Nogei'a, Meisit and Nosei

1️⃣1️⃣ Three Forms of Contact

👉 A Beraisa discusses:

- Nogei'a – touching
- Meisit – moving
- Nosei – carrying.

Rebbe Eliezer adds:

- Af hanosei.

The Gemara asks:

What is Rebbe Eliezer adding?

If you:

- Carry something

You have obviously:

- Moved it.

So every Nosei is already:

- Meisit.

1️⃣2️⃣ Rebbe Eliezer Is Qualifying the Rule

👉 The Gemara explains that Rebbe Eliezer is not:

- Adding a third independent case.

Rather, he is qualifying the earlier rule:

For carrying to create Tumah:

- The neveilah must be capable of being carried as one unit.

This supports:

- Ulla's requirement of nisa – one connected entity.

The Kulis – A Bone Filled with Marrow

1️⃣3️⃣ Three Different Bones

👉 The Mishnah discusses the kulis – the femur – in three contexts:

- Kodshim
- Neveilah
- Sheretz.

The marrow is inside:

- A hard outer bone.

The question is whether the bone:

- Blocks access to the Tumah inside
- Or whether the Tumah can nevertheless affect someone outside.

Kulis of Kodshim

1️⃣4️⃣ Marrow That Became Nosar

👉 A femur of Kodshim can contain:

- Marrow that became Nosar.

Touching the bone can make:

- A person's hands tamei

Whether the bone is:

- Closed
- Or punctured.

📌 Why?

The bone serves:

- The forbidden Nosar inside it.

The Gemara later explains that:

- Shimush Nosar milsa hi – serving Nosar is itself significant.

Kulis of Neveilah or Sheretz

1️⃣5️⃣ Closed vs Punctured

👉 With the femur of:

- Neveilah
- Or a sheretz

There is a major distinction.

If the bone is:

- Completely sealed – it is tahor for Maga.

If it has:

- Even a tiny hole – it can transmit Tumah through Maga.

Why?

Once there is an opening:

- The Tumah inside is accessible.

1️⃣6️⃣ What About Masa?

👉 The Mishnah indicates that:

- Where Maga cannot apply
- Masa may also not apply.

This brings us back to the original question:

Can a sealed bone containing a full shiur of marrow:

- Give Tumah through carrying
- Even though the marrow cannot be touched?

Why Doesn't the Marrow Create Ohel Tumah?

1️⃣7️⃣ Tumah Boka'as V'Olah

👉 The Gemara now raises a major question regarding:

- A human femur containing marrow.

If there is a kezayis of human tissue inside:

Why doesn't its Tumah:

- Break through the bone
- And spread into the surrounding Ohel?

The principle is:

- Tumah boka'as v'olah – Tumah trapped without the required space can break upward.

So the sealed bone should seemingly:

- Not prevent Ohel Tumah.

1️⃣8️⃣ Is the Bone a Complete Eiver?

👉 The Gemara considers another possibility.

Perhaps marrow inside the bone:

- Supports and regenerates the flesh outside.

If so:

- The bone together with its marrow could constitute an eiver.

And a complete limb from a meis:

- Has its own laws of Tumah.

The question therefore becomes:

- Does the marrow inside contribute to regeneration of the flesh outside?

Different Cases Have Different Shiurim

1️⃣9️⃣ Human Bone vs Neveilah

👉 The Gemara distinguishes between the cases.

Regarding the human bone:

- The necessary shiur of marrow is absent.

Therefore:

- It does not create the expected Ohel Tumah.

But regarding:

- Neveilah or sheretz

There can be:

- The required shiur inside.

The Mishnah is teaching:

- Separate chiddushim in each case.

2️⃣0️⃣ The Chiddush of Kodshim

👉 In the case of Kodshim, the Gemara teaches:

- Shimush Nosar milsa hi.

The bone is serving as:

- A container or support for the Nosar inside.

Chazal therefore treated:

- The bone itself as significant in relation to the Nosar.

This can make:

- The hands tamei.

2️⃣1️⃣ The Chiddush of Neveilah

👉 Even if the marrow contains:

- A full kezayis of neveilah

The closed bone prevents:

- Tumah through Maga.

Only when the bone is:

- Punctured

Can the marrow inside:

- Create Tumah through contact.

Abaye – Marrow Can Regenerate

2️⃣ 2️⃣ Abaye Disagrees

👉 Abaye says:

- Marrow can indeed help regenerate the flesh outside the bone.

So why isn't the bone:

- Always considered a complete limb?

The answer depends on:

- How the bone was cut.

2️⃣ 3️⃣ Lengthwise vs Around the Bone

👉 Abaye distinguishes between:

- A cut running lengthwise
- A cut around the circumference.

If the structure remains capable of:

- Carrying nutrients along its length

It can continue:

- Supporting and regenerating the flesh.

But if it is severed around its circumference:

- That ability is cut off.

📌 The Siman – A Tree

The Gemara compares this to:

- A tree.

A lengthwise wound:

- Does not necessarily destroy the tree.

But cutting around the trunk:

- Interrupts the flow that keeps it alive.

Maga and Ohel

2️⃣4️⃣ Can Ohel Be Considered Maga?

👉 The Gemara now begins a fascinating discussion:

Is Tumah through Ohel fundamentally considered:

- A form of Maga – touching?

For example:

- Half a kezayis is physically touched
- Another half a kezayis is directly above the person.

Can the two combine?

If Ohel and Maga are:

- The same category

Then together they can form:

- A full kezayis.

2️⃣5️⃣ Tumah Travels Down as Well

👉 An important point emerges:

Ohel Tumah does not only spread:

- Upward.

It can also extend:

- Downward.

Therefore, being underneath Tumah can place a person:

- Within the Tumah of the Ohel

Just as being above it can.

2️⃣6️⃣ Half Through Maga + Half Through Ohel

👉 The Gemara discusses:

- Half a kezayis which the person physically touches
- Another half a kezayis positioned over him.

If he becomes tamei:

- It suggests Maga and Ohel can be treated as one category.

Why?

He has effectively experienced:

- Two half-shiurim of the same type of Tumah.

2️⃣7️⃣ But Another Case Is Tahor

👉 A second case seems to contradict this.

A person:

- Physically touches one half-kezayis
- While another half-kezayis shares an Ohel with him in a different arrangement.

Here:

- He remains tahor.

If Ohel is simply Maga:

- Why shouldn't the two halves combine here as well?

Tumah Within a Tefach

2️⃣8️⃣ Ohel That Is Like Touching

👉 The Gemara distinguishes between two kinds of Ohel.

When the person is:

- Extremely close to the Tumah
- Within less than a tefach

The Tumah is considered:

- Like direct contact.

This is:

- Ohel that functions as Negiah.

But when there is:

- A regular Ohel arrangement

- With greater separation

It remains:

- Ordinary Ohel Tumah
- Not Maga.

Decomposed Human Remains

2️⃣9️⃣ How Can Maga Work?

👉 The Gemara brings another proof from:

- Decomposed human remains.

These remains consist of:

- Many tiny particles.

They can transmit Tumah through:

- Maga
- Masa
- Ohel.

But how can Maga work?

When a person touches them:

- He cannot possibly touch every particle needed for the shiur.

📌 Answer

His contact places him within:

- The concentrated Tumah immediately surrounding the remains.

Therefore:

- It is treated as though he contacted the full Tumah.

This again demonstrates:

- That certain forms of Ohel can function halachically like Maga.

3️⃣0️⃣ Within a Tefach vs Regular Ohel

👉 The Gemara concludes the distinction:

If the Tumah is:

- Within a tefach

The Ohel can be considered:

- Negiah – a form of contact.

If it is:

- Further away

It is:

- Regular Ohel Tumah.

Therefore:

- Maga and this close-range Ohel can combine
- While ordinary Ohel and Maga remain separate categories.

📌 **Key Chazarah**

- Rebbe Yishmael holds that two separate half-kezaysim do not simply combine for Maga; Rebbe Akiva can allow combination in situations where the hide is not mevatel them.
- Rebbe Dosa ben Harkinas similarly says two half-kezaysim do not combine for Ohel, while the Chachamim disagree.
- Rebbe Akiva links Maga and Masa: where Maga cannot apply, Masa may not apply either.
- Rav Avya Sava asked whether carrying a sealed femur containing marrow causes Tumah even though the marrow cannot be touched.
- Rabbah bar Rav Huna avoided answering because he was exhausted after giving a demanding shiur and the question required serious thought.
- Ulla derives that Masa requires the Tumah to be one connected unit; two halves work only where they are connected by a thin strand.
- A sealed femur of neveilah does not transmit Tumah through Maga, while even a tiny opening can change its status.
- A bone containing Nosar is different because the bone serves the forbidden material inside it.

- Abaye holds that marrow can contribute to regeneration; whether it does so can depend on how the bone was cut.
- Ohel Tumah can spread downward as well as upward.
- Ohel within a tefach can be treated like Negiah, allowing it to combine with actual Maga.
- Ordinary Ohel at a greater distance remains a separate category and does not necessarily combine with Maga.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk

📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download

🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל