Chullin 115 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ How Do We Know Basar B'chalav May Not Be Eaten?

👉 The Torah explicitly says:

- Do not cook meat and milk together

But where does the Torah say:

- Do not eat it?

Rav Ashi derives it from the general prohibition:

- לא תאכל כל תועבה
- Do not eat anything made abominable through a prohibited act

📌 The Principle

👉 If the Torah tells us:

- Not to perform a particular act with food

Then food produced through that prohibited act:

- May not be eaten

Therefore, since the Torah prohibits:

- Cooking meat with milk

The resulting Basar b'chalav:

- May not be eaten.

איסור הנאה – Benefit from Basar B'chalav

2️⃣ How Do We Know We Cannot Benefit from It?

👉 Rebbe Abahu teaches in the name of Rebbe Elazar:

Whenever the Torah uses expressions such as:

- לא יאכל
- לא תאכל
- לא תאכלו

The prohibition generally includes:

- Eating

- And deriving benefit

Unless:

- The Torah specifically permits benefit.

📌 **Therefore**

👉 Once Basar b'chalav is included in a prohibition of eating:

- Benefit is also prohibited

Unless we find:

- A specific Torah exception.

Neveilah – An Exception

3️⃣ **Neveilah May Be Sold or Given Away**

👉 The Torah says regarding neveilah:

Although:

- A Jew may not eat it

He may:

- Give it to a Ger Toshav
- Or sell it to a non-Jew

📌 **What Does This Show?**

👉 Normally, wording prohibiting eating can also prohibit:

- Benefit

But neveilah is different because:

- The Torah specifically permits benefit from it.

4️⃣ **Rebbe Meir & Rebbe Yehudah**

👉 Rebbe Meir understands that neveilah may be:

- Given or sold to a Ger Toshav
- Given or sold to a non-Jew

Rebbe Yehudah disagrees.

He understands the Torah more literally:

- Give it to the Ger Toshav
- Sell it to the non-Jew.

📌 **Why?**

👉 Rebbe Yehudah focuses on the Torah's word:

- “Or”

This separates:

- Giving to the Ger
- From selling to the non-Jew.

🛑 **Giving to a Ger Toshav Comes First**

👉 Even according to Rebbe Meir:

If there is a choice between:

- Giving the neveilah to a Ger Toshav
- Selling it to a non-Jew

There is a preference to:

- Give it to the Ger Toshav.

📌 **Why?**

👉 The Torah commands us:

- To support the Ger Toshav

Therefore:

- Helping him takes priority.

The transcript brings Tosafos explaining that this does not mean a person must suffer:

- A substantial financial loss

The preference applies where:

- The loss from giving it away is relatively small.

Why Doesn't "Do Not Eat Any Abomination" Apply Everywhere?

6️⃣ Food Produced Through Shabbos

👉 If every forbidden act involving food makes the result forbidden, the Gemara asks:

What about food produced through:

- A prohibited act on Shabbos?

Why isn't that food permanently forbidden?

📌 Answer

👉 The Torah says regarding Shabbos:

- "It is holy to you"

Meaning:

- Shabbos itself is holy

But:

- The product created through the prohibited act does not automatically become holy or forbidden.

Therefore:

- The general rule of "do not eat any abomination" cannot simply be applied here.

7️⃣ Plowing with Two Different Animals

👉 The Gemara asks similarly:

If someone:

- Plows with an ox and donkey together

Or:

- Muzzles an animal while it works

Why isn't the produce created through that prohibited act forbidden?

📌 Answer

👉 These can be learned from:

- Shabbos

Shabbos is:

- A much more severe prohibition

Yet:

- The product of the prohibited act does not become permanently forbidden

Certainly:

- The produce from these lesser prohibitions need not become forbidden.

8️⃣ Why Is Basar B'chalav Different?

👉 Basar b'chalav is fundamentally different.

With Basar b'chalav:

- The actual meat and milk are the objects involved in the prohibited act
- And those same objects are subsequently eaten

With plowing:

- The Torah prohibited the act of plowing
- The later produce is merely the result of that act.

📌 Therefore

👉 "Do not eat any abomination" applies more directly to:

- Basar b'chalav

Because one eats:

- The very mixture created through the prohibited act.

Kilayim – Mixed Seeds

9️⃣ What About Planting Different Seeds Together?

👉 This seems closer to Basar b'chalav.

The Torah prohibits:

- Planting certain species together

And the resulting plants are:

- The actual items involved.

Why then aren't all products of mixed planting:

- Forbidden to eat or benefit from?

🔟 Kil’ei Hakerem Is Different

👉 The Torah specifically teaches regarding:

- Kil’ei hakerem – forbidden mixtures planted in a vineyard

That they become:

- Forbidden for benefit.

📌 What Does This Imply?

👉 This special prohibition applies specifically to:

- Kil’ei hakerem

Ordinary mixed seeds:

- Do not receive the same prohibition of benefit.

The Gemara continues to establish that:

- Ordinary kilayim may also be eaten.

1️⃣1️⃣ Mixed Species of Animals

👉 The Torah prohibits:

- Breeding different animal species together

Nevertheless:

- The resulting offspring may be eaten

The Gemara derives this from the fact that:

- Such an animal is specifically excluded from being brought as a korban

This implies:

- It is unsuitable for the Mizbe’ach
- But remains permitted for ordinary use and eating.

אותו ואת בנו

1️⃣2️⃣ Mother and Offspring Slaughtered on the Same Day

👉 The Torah prohibits:

- Slaughtering a mother and its offspring on the same day

Why doesn't the meat become forbidden because:

- It resulted from a prohibited shechitah?

📌 Answer

👉 Such an animal is compared to:

- Mechusar zman – an animal whose proper time has not yet arrived

It may be restricted for:

- Korban purposes

But:

- The meat remains permitted to an ordinary person.

Therefore:

- Violating Oso v'es Beno does not make the meat forbidden.

שילוח הקן

1️⃣3️⃣ What About the Mother Bird?

👉 The Gemara asks about:

- Shiluach Haken

The Torah requires a person:

- To send away the mother bird before taking the young.

If he fails to do so:

- Why doesn't the mother become forbidden as something involved in a prohibited act?

📌 Answer

👉 The Torah itself commands:

- “Send away the mother”

If the mother became permanently forbidden:

- The Torah would effectively be sending a forbidden item out into the world

Where:

- Someone else could unknowingly eat it.

Therefore:

- The mother does not become permanently forbidden.

Further Sources for Basar B’chalav

1️⃣4️⃣ Reish Lakish – Korban Pesach

👉 Reish Lakish gives another source that Basar b’chalav is forbidden.

Regarding Korban Pesach, the Torah uses:

- An extra expression relating to cooking

Basar b’chalav is also uniquely defined by:

- A prohibition of cooking.

Therefore, Reish Lakish connects:

- The two prohibitions

To derive:

- The prohibition of Basar b’chalav.

1️⃣5️⃣ Rebbe Yochanan Challenges Reish Lakish

👉 Rebbe Yochanan tells Reish Lakish:

- There is a better source from the teaching of Rebbe.

Rebbe derives the prohibition from:

- פסולי המוקדשין
- A consecrated animal that developed a blemish and was redeemed.

Such an animal contains aspects of:

- Kodshim

- Chullin

It is therefore treated in certain respects as:

- Two types combined together.

1️⃣6️⃣ Why Is That Similar to Basar B'chalav?

👉 Basar b'chalav also consists of:

- Two separate types
- Meat and milk

The Torah has an extra expression:

- "You shall not eat it"

Regarding Pesulei Hamukdashin.

Rebbe applies this extra prohibition to:

- Basar b'chalav

Because both involve:

- A combination of two distinct types.

1️⃣7️⃣ Why Does Reish Lakish Need Another Source?

👉 The Gemara explains:

Rebbe's source establishes:

- The prohibition against eating Basar b'chalav

But Reish Lakish wants a source for:

- The prohibition of benefit as well.

Therefore:

- He derives it from Korban Pesach.

Another Source for איסור הנאה

1️⃣8️⃣ Selling Neveilah – But Don't Cook It with Milk

👉 The Torah discusses neveilah and says:

- It may be given or sold

In the same passage, it says:

- Do not cook a gedi in its mother's milk.

The Gemara understands:

When selling the neveilah:

- Sell it as it is

But:

- Do not first cook it with milk.

📌 **Why?**

👉 Once it becomes Basar b'chalav:

- One may no longer benefit from it

Therefore:

- It cannot even be prepared as Basar b'chalav for the purpose of selling it.

This provides another source for:

- Issur hana'ah of Basar b'chalav.

The Familiar Threefold Prohibition

1️⃣9️⃣ **Three Times "Do Not Cook"**

👉 The Torah states three times:

- Do not cook a gedi in its mother's milk

The familiar teaching uses these three repetitions for:

- Cooking
- Eating
- Deriving benefit

📌 **Important**

👉 The Gemara has already presented:

- Several other sources

Before reaching this familiar derivation.

The three repetitions provide the direct source for the three separate prohibitions of:

- Bishul
- Achilah
- Hana'ah.

Another Derivation – "Kadosh"

2️⃣0️⃣ Basar B'chalav & Treifah

👉 Another teaching derives the prohibition of eating Basar b'chalav through a Gezeirah Shavah.

Regarding Basar b'chalav it says:

- "For you are a holy nation"

Regarding treifah it also uses:

- "Holy"

📌 **Therefore**

👉 Just as:

- Treifah may not be eaten

So too:

- Basar b'chalav may not be eaten.

How Do We Know It Is Also Forbidden for Benefit?

2️⃣1️⃣ Learning from Orlah

👉 The Gemara attempts a Kal Vachomer from:

- Orlah

Orlah:

- Was not created through a prohibited act

Yet:

- It is forbidden for benefit.

Basar b’chalav:

- Is created through the prohibited act of cooking

Certainly:

- It should be forbidden for benefit.

📌 **Problem**

👉 Orlah has a special stringency:

- It never had a period when it was permitted

The fruit is forbidden:

- From the moment it comes into existence during the first three years.

Basar b’chalav is different:

- The meat was permitted
- The milk was permitted
- Only their combination creates the prohibition.

2️⃣ 2️⃣ **Learning from Chametz on Pesach**

👉 The Gemara therefore turns to:

- Chametz on Pesach

Chametz:

- Was permitted before Pesach
- And later becomes forbidden

It is also:

- Forbidden for benefit.

This appears closer to:

- Basar b’chalav.

📌 **Problem**

👉 Chametz on Pesach is more severe because:

- Eating it carries Kares.

Therefore:

- It cannot independently prove Basar b'chalav.

2️⃣3️⃣ Kil'ei Hakerem

👉 The Gemara adds:

- Kil'ei hakerem

This too:

- Is forbidden for benefit

But:

- Does not carry the same Kares as chametz.

The Gemara therefore considers combining:

- Orlah
- Chametz
- Kil'ei hakerem

📌 The Tzad Hashaveh

👉 Although each has its own unique stringency:

They share:

- A prohibition of eating
- And a prohibition of benefit.

From their common denominator:

- Basar b'chalav could also be derived as forbidden for benefit.

2️⃣4️⃣ Why Do We Still Need the Gezeirah Shavah?

👉 The Gemara asks:

If Basar b'chalav can be learned from:

- Orlah

- Chametz
- Kil'ei hakerem

Why did we first need:

- The Gezeirah Shavah from treifah

To establish that it may not be eaten?

📌 **The Challenge**

👉 The comparison is not complete.

There are other Torah prohibitions where:

- A person performs a forbidden act

Yet:

- The resulting item remains permitted.

Therefore:

- The broader comparison cannot by itself establish every aspect of Basar b'chalav

And:

- The specific Torah derivation remains necessary.

📌 **Key Chazarah**

- Rav Ashi derives the prohibition of eating Basar b'chalav from "Do not eat any abomination" – food created through a prohibited act may itself become forbidden.
- Rebbe Abahu teaches that expressions prohibiting eating generally also prohibit benefit unless the Torah specifically permits it.
- Neveilah is an exception because the Torah explicitly allows it to be given to a Ger Toshav or sold to a non-Jew.
- Rebbe Meir and Rebbe Yehudah disagree about whether giving and selling apply to both recipients; supporting a Ger Toshav takes priority where the financial loss is small.
- Products created through Shabbos, prohibited plowing and similar aveiros do not automatically become forbidden; Basar b'chalav is different because the actual prohibited mixture is subsequently eaten.

- Ordinary mixed seeds and offspring created from mixed animal species remain permitted; Kil'ei Hakerem is specifically forbidden for benefit.
- Meat from Oso v'es Beno remains permitted, and the mother bird in Shiluach Haken does not become permanently forbidden.
- Reish Lakish derives Basar b'chalav from Korban Pesach, while Rebbe derives its eating prohibition from Pesulei Hamukdashin.
- The placement of Basar b'chalav next to the law permitting benefit from neveilah provides another source that Basar b'chalav itself may not be used for benefit.
- The Torah's three repetitions of "Do not cook" are the familiar source for the prohibitions of cooking, eating and deriving benefit.
- Another teaching derives the eating prohibition through a Gezeirah Shavah from treifah using the word "holy."
- The Gemara attempts to derive the prohibition of benefit through Orlah, Chametz on Pesach and Kil'ei Hakerem, eventually combining their common denominator.

📘 **Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:**

https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk

📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download

🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל