Chullin 114 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Does One Prohibition Take Effect on Top of Another?

👉 The Gemara returns to Shmuel's teaching that the Torah includes:

- Cheilev – forbidden fat
- In the prohibition of Basar b'chalav

Meaning:

- Even though cheilev is already forbidden
- Cooking it with milk can create an additional prohibition of Basar b'chalav.

📌 The Question

👉 This appears to show that Shmuel holds:

- Issur chal al issur
- One prohibition can take effect on something already prohibited

But elsewhere, regarding a tamei Kohen eating tamei terumah, Shmuel appears to hold:

- Ein issur chal al issur
- A second prohibition does not take effect.

2️⃣ Three Ways to Explain Shmuel

👉 The Gemara gives three possibilities:

1. Shmuel generally holds:

- Issur chal al issur

Terumah is different:

- Because of a special Torah teaching.

2. Shmuel generally holds:

- Ein issur chal al issur

Basar b'chalav is different:

- Because the Torah specifically includes cheilev through the extra word "gedi."

3. The two statements represent:

- Shmuel
- And his Rebbe

Meaning:

- They did not necessarily hold the same opinion.

What Counts as "Its Mother's Milk"?

3️⃣ Milk from an Animal That Has Not Yet Given Birth

👉 The Torah says:

- "Do not cook a gedi in its mother's milk"

The Gemara asks about milk from:

- A female animal that has not yet given birth

She is not yet:

- A mother

Is her milk included?

📌 **Answer**

👉 Yes.

The Torah excludes:

- Milk from a male

But milk from a female:

- Is included
- Because she is capable of becoming a mother.

Therefore:

- Her milk is included in Basar b'chalav even before she has given birth.

Cheilev Cooked with Milk

4️⃣ A Machlokes About Malkus

👉 Rebbe Ami and Rebbe Assi discuss:

- One who cooks cheilev – forbidden animal fat – with milk

One says:

- He receives malkus

The other says:

- He does not.

📌 **First Explanation**

👉 Perhaps they disagree about:

- Issur chal al issur

The cheilev is already forbidden.

Can:

- Basar b'chalav

Take effect as:

- An additional prohibition?

5️⃣ **Cooking and Eating Are Different**

👉 The Gemara rejects that simple explanation.

Everyone may agree that regarding eating:

- The Basar b'chalav prohibition cannot necessarily take effect on top of the existing cheilev prohibition

The machlokes could instead concern:

- Cooking

📌 **The Question**

👉 Even if one cannot receive malkus for eating the cheilev with milk:

Can he still receive malkus for:

- Cooking them together?

One view:

- Yes
- Cooking is an independent Torah prohibition

The other view:

- No
- If this combination cannot create the eating prohibition of Basar b'chalav, it also does not create the cooking prohibition.

6️⃣ Another Explanation

👉 The Gemara gives the opposite possibility:

Everyone agrees:

- One receives malkus for cooking cheilev with milk

Because:

- He has performed the prohibited act of cooking meat and milk together

The machlokes concerns:

- Eating it

One view:

- Ein issur chal al issur
- Therefore, no additional malkus for eating Basar b'chalav

The other view:

- Since the Basar b'chalav prohibition applies to its cooking
- It can also apply to its eating.

What Is Not Considered Basar B'chalav?

7️⃣ Whey, Blood, Bones & Sinews

👉 A Beraisa lists several cases where cooking with milk does not create the Torah prohibition of Basar b'chalav.

One who cooks meat with:

- Mei chalav – the watery liquid separated from milk

Is exempt.

Similarly, one who cooks milk with:

- Blood
- Bones
- Sinews
- Horns
- Hooves

Is exempt.

📌 **Why?**

👉 These are not considered:

- Regular meat and milk

Required for the Torah prohibition.

8️⃣ **Pigul, Nosar & Tamei Meat**

👉 The Beraisa continues:

If one cooks milk with meat that is already forbidden as:

- Pigul
- Nosar
- Tamei

He is liable for Basar b'chalav.

📌 **What Does This Show?**

👉 These foods were:

- Already forbidden

Yet:

- Basar b'chalav can still take effect

This appears to support:

- Issur chal al issur.

📌 **Gemara's Answer**

👉 That Beraisa may simply follow:

- The Tanna who holds issur chal al issur

Therefore:

- It does not establish the rule according to everyone.

מי חלב – Whey

9️⃣ Is Whey Considered Milk?

👉 The Gemara discusses:

- Mei chalav – the watery liquid that separates from milk

Regarding Basar b'chalav:

- Cooking meat in it does not create the regular Torah prohibition

But Reish Lakish explains:

- This does not mean it is never considered milk.

🔟 Whey Can Prepare Food to Become Tamei

👉 Before food can become tamei:

- It must first come into contact with one of the qualifying liquids

Milk is:

- One of those liquids.

Reish Lakish explains that whey:

- Is considered milk for making food susceptible to tumah

But:

- It is not considered milk for the Torah prohibition of cooking Basar b'chalav.

📌 Key Distinction

👉 The definition of "milk" can therefore differ:

- Depending on the particular halacha being discussed.

Which Animals' Milk Is Included?

1️⃣1️⃣ Milk from a Cow or Sheep

👉 The Torah says:

- “In its mother’s milk”

The Gemara asks:

How do we know the prohibition is not limited to:

- A goat’s own mother’s milk?

Perhaps milk from:

- A cow
- A sheep
- Or another kosher animal

Should be permitted.

1️⃣2️⃣ The Kal Vachomer

👉 The Gemara initially attempts a kal vachomer.

A mother and her offspring:

- May breed with each other
- Yet cooking the offspring in its mother’s milk is forbidden

Other animals that have:

- Greater restrictions concerning breeding

Should certainly have their milk included.

📌 But Why Do We Need a Pasuk?

👉 The Torah nevertheless teaches:

- “Its mother’s milk”

To include:

- Milk from other kosher animals.

The Gemara asks:

- Why is the pasuk necessary if we already have a kal vachomer?

1️⃣3️⃣ Rav Ashi – The Kal Vachomer Can Be Challenged

👉 Rav Ashi answers:

The mother has a special stringency:

- Oso v'es beno

One may not slaughter:

- A mother and its offspring on the same day

That stringency does not apply:

- Between unrelated animals

Therefore:

- The kal vachomer is not conclusive

And:

- The pasuk is necessary.

Milk of an Older Sister

1️⃣4️⃣ A Goat with Its Older Sister's Milk

👉 The Gemara asks:

How do we know that one may not cook a goat:

- In the milk of its older sister?

"Older sister" means:

- She was born in a previous Maaser Beheima year

Therefore:

- She cannot be included together with her younger sibling for Maaser Beheima.

1️⃣5️⃣ Another Kal Vachomer

👉 The Gemara attempts to derive this from:

- The mother

A mother and offspring can sometimes:

- Belong to the same Maaser Beheima year

Yet:

- Her milk is forbidden with her offspring.

An older sister:

- Cannot be included in the same Maaser Beheima year

Therefore:

- Her milk should certainly be forbidden.

📌 **Problem**

👉 Again, the mother has the special stringency of:

- Oso v'es beno

Therefore:

- The comparison is not complete.

1️⃣6️⃣ **Building the Law from Several Cases**

👉 The Gemara combines several cases:

- The mother
- An unrelated cow
- The older sister

Each has:

- A stringency the others do not have

But together:

- They establish that milk does not need to come specifically from the animal's actual mother.

👉 From their common denominator:

- The Gemara can also include the milk of a younger sister.

This is a classic:

- Tzad hashaveh – deriving a law from the common feature of several cases.

Cooking an Animal in Its Own Milk

1️⃣7️⃣ What About the Mother Herself?

👉 The Gemara asks another unusual question:

The Torah explicitly prohibits cooking:

- An offspring in its mother's milk

But how do we know one may not cook:

- The mother itself
- In its own milk?

1️⃣8️⃣ A Third Kal Vachomer

👉 The Gemara again attempts a kal vachomer.

If the Torah prohibits:

- One offspring together with another product of the mother – her milk

Then certainly:

- The mother herself should be forbidden with her own milk.

Again, however:

- The Gemara examines whether the comparison is valid.

1️⃣9️⃣ The Gemara Tests the Comparison

👉 The Gemara explores examples involving:

- Breeding animals of different species
- Slaves who have been freed
- Different relationships between a "mother" and her "offspring"

The purpose is to determine:

- Whether an offspring can sometimes have a stricter relationship with another offspring than with its own mother

If so:

- The proposed kal vachomer cannot be relied upon.

2️⃣0️⃣ Kilayim – The Final Comparison

👉 The Gemara ultimately compares this to:

- Kilayim – planting mixed species

Two different seeds:

- Do not create a prohibition merely by being placed together

The prohibition occurs when:

- They are planted in the ground

The ground is compared to:

- Their “mother”

📌 Therefore

👉 The relationship between:

- A product
- And its source

Cannot simply be derived from the earlier kal vachomer.

Therefore:

- A Torah teaching is needed to establish the Basar b’chalav prohibition even when the animal is cooked in its own milk.

📌 Key Chazarah

- Shmuel includes cheilev in Basar b’chalav, leading to the question whether he holds issur chal al issur.
- The Gemara gives three ways to reconcile Shmuel’s apparently conflicting statements.
- Milk from a female animal that has not yet given birth is included in Basar b’chalav; milk from a male is excluded.

- Rebbe Ami and Rebbe Assi disagree about cooking cheilev with milk, and the Gemara explains their machlokes in terms of the separate prohibitions of cooking and eating.
- Whey, blood, bones, sinews, horns and hooves do not create the regular Torah prohibition of Basar b'chalav when cooked with milk.
- Pigul, nosar and tamei meat can still be subject to Basar b'chalav according to the view that issur chal al issur.
- Whey is not considered milk for Basar b'chalav, but is considered a liquid capable of preparing food to receive tumah.
- The Gemara uses and then challenges a kal vachomer to determine how we know milk from animals other than the actual mother is included.
- Oso v'es beno – the prohibition against slaughtering a mother and offspring on the same day – repeatedly prevents the proposed kal vachomers from being conclusive.
- The Gemara discusses milk from an older and younger sister and uses a common-denominator argument to include them.
- Finally, the Gemara investigates how we know an animal may not be cooked in its own milk, testing comparisons involving breeding, slaves and kilayim.

📘 **Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:**

https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk

📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download

🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל