Chullin 109 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Efshar L'Sochto – Does the Piece Remain Asur?

👉 The Gemara continues the sugya of efshar l'sochto.

A drop of milk falls onto:

- One piece of meat

If the milk gives flavor to that piece:

- The piece becomes asur

The question is what happens if the absorbed milk later comes out of the meat.

👉 Efshar l'sochto asur:

- Even if the milk comes out, the original piece remains asur
- It has become a chatichah of neveilah

👉 Efshar l'sochto mutar:

- Once the milk comes out, the original piece can become mutar again.

2️⃣ Rebbe Yehudah & Chachamim

👉 A drop of milk falls onto one piece of meat and gives flavor to it.

Rebbe Yehudah:

- The piece becomes asur
- It can then prohibit the other pieces because min b'mino is not batel

Chachamim:

- The pot is not prohibited unless there is enough forbidden taste to give flavor throughout the gravy, pieces and contents of the pot.

3️⃣ Rebbe – It Depends Whether He Stirred

👉 Rebbe says:

- In one situation the halacha follows Rebbe Yehudah
- In another it follows the Chachamim

The Gemara explains:

If he did not stir at the beginning:

- The milk has time to enter the first piece
- That piece becomes asur

If he stirred properly from the beginning:

- The milk immediately spreads throughout the pot
- It does not first concentrate in one piece

👉 If he only stirs later:

- The first piece has already absorbed the milk
- Afterwards, the milk can be released and spread throughout the pot

---

4️⃣ Proof Regarding Efshar L'Sochto

👉 If the first piece absorbed the milk and later released it when the pot was stirred:

Why should that first piece remain asur?

The milk has now:

- Left the piece
- Spread throughout the pot

👉 This indicates:

- Efshar l'sochto asur

Once the piece became forbidden:

- It remains forbidden even after the milk comes out.

5️⃣ What If He Stirred the Whole Time?

👉 The Gemara clarifies Rebbe Yehudah's position.

If the pot was stirred:

- Properly from beginning to end

Then even Rebbe Yehudah would not necessarily prohibit it.

Why?

- The milk never had an opportunity to concentrate in and prohibit one particular piece

👉 The concern is that:

- He may not have stirred properly
- The milk may initially have remained on one piece long enough to prohibit it.

6️⃣ Is the Machlokes Really About Min B'Mino?

👉 The Gemara considers another possibility.

Perhaps everyone agrees:

- The original piece remains asur

And the machlokes is only what happens when that piece mixes with the other meat.

Rebbe Yehudah:

- Min b'mino is not batel
- Therefore the forbidden piece prohibits the rest

Chachamim:

- Min b'mino can be batel

👉 The Gemara rejects this explanation of Rebbe's statement.

Rebbe specifically distinguishes between:

- Stirring
- Not stirring

That distinction concerns whether the original piece itself becomes or remains forbidden.

📌 Conclusion

👉 The machlokes is indeed connected to:

- Efshar l'sochto

Whether a piece that became forbidden can return to being permitted after the forbidden substance comes out.

כחל – Milk Inside the Udder

7️⃣ The Mishnah – The Udder

👉 The Mishnah discusses the udder of a slaughtered animal, which contains milk.

Before eating it:

- One tears the udder
- And removes its milk

If he did not tear it:

- The Mishnah says “eino over alav”

👉 The Gemara discusses whether this means:

- It is actually permitted
- Or it is forbidden, although one does not violate the regular Torah prohibition of Basar b’chalav.

8️⃣ The Heart – Removing Its Blood

👉 The Mishnah uses almost identical wording regarding the heart.

The heart:

- Is torn open
- Its blood is removed

If this was not done before cooking:

- It can be torn open afterwards
- The blood is removed

👉 The Gemara distinguishes between:

- The milk inside an udder
- The blood inside a heart

Even though the Mishnah uses similar wording:

- Their halachos are not necessarily the same.

9️⃣ Two Versions of Rav

👉 Rebbe Zeira quotes Rav regarding an udder that was not torn.

One version:

- It is permitted

Another version:

- It is forbidden

👉 The Gemara tries to determine Rav's position from the wording of the Mishnah and a Beraisa.

🔟 Can It Be Fixed After Cooking?

👉 Regarding the heart:

If it was cooked without first being torn:

- It can still be torn afterwards
- The blood can be removed

The Gemara asks:

Why does the Beraisa specifically give this remedy for:

- The heart

But not for:

- The udder?

📌 Two Possibilities

Either:

- The udder does not need this remedy because it remains permitted

Or:

- Once the udder was cooked, tearing it afterwards will no longer help

👉 The Gemara uses this discussion to clarify Rav's opinion.

1️⃣1️⃣ Proof – The Milk of the Udder Is Permitted

👉 A Beraisa states regarding the udder:

- Its milk is permitted

The Gemara understands this as support for:

- The lenient version of Rav

Meaning:

- The milk contained within the udder does not have the regular status of milk for Basar b'chalav.

1️⃣2️⃣ Milk Found Inside a Calf

👉 The Gemara contrasts this with milk found:

- Inside the stomach of a calf after it nursed

That milk is different.

📌 Why?

Milk inside the udder:

- Has not yet left the animal

Milk inside the calf:

- Already left the mother when the calf drank it

Therefore:

- The two are not treated the same.

1️⃣3️⃣ How Is the Udder Prepared?

👉 Rav Yehudah explains:

One tears the udder:

- Lengthwise and crosswise

And:

- Presses it against the wall

This removes:

- The milk contained inside.

1️⃣4️⃣ Roasting the Udder

👉 Rebbe Elazar told his attendant:

- Tear the udder
- And I will eat it

The Gemara discusses the case of:

- Roasting

Roasting differs from cooking because:

- The liquid that comes out drains away
- Rather than remaining together and cooking with the meat.

Yalta – A Permitted Equivalent

1️⃣5️⃣ Yalta's Principle

👉 The daf concludes with the famous discussion involving Yalta, the wife of Rav Nachman.

Yalta says:

For things that the Torah prohibited:

- There is something similar that the Torah permitted.

She gives several examples.

1️⃣6️⃣ Examples

👉 Blood is forbidden.

But:

- Liver provides a similar taste.

👉 The blood of a Niddah is forbidden.

But:

- There is dam tohar following childbirth.

👉 Cheilev of a beheima is forbidden.

But:

- Cheilev of a chayah is permitted.

👉 Chazir is forbidden.

But:

- The brain of the shibuta fish provides a similar taste.

👉 Girusa, a forbidden bird, has a permitted equivalent in:

- The tongue of a certain fish.

👉 Eishes ish is forbidden.

But:

- A divorced woman is permitted during her former husband's lifetime.

👉 Eishes ach – one's brother's wife – is normally forbidden.

But:

- Yibum permits her in the required situation.

👉 A non-Jewish woman is forbidden.

But the Torah permits:

- Yefas toar under its specific conditions.

1️⃣7️⃣ Yalta Wants the Taste of Basar B'Chalav

👉 Yalta tells Rav Nachman:

- She wants the permitted equivalent of Basar b'chalav.

Rav Nachman therefore instructs:

- That udder should be prepared for her

📌 Connection to the Sugya

👉 The udder provides:

- A permitted way of experiencing a taste resembling meat and milk

This connects directly to the Gemara's discussion that:

- The milk contained within the udder has a different status from ordinary milk.

📌 Key Chazarah

- Efshar l’sochto asks whether a piece that became forbidden can become permitted again after the forbidden substance comes out.
- Rebbe Yehudah says a piece that absorbed milk becomes asur and can prohibit the other meat because min b’mino is not batel.
- If the pot is stirred immediately, the milk spreads before concentrating in one piece; if stirred only later, the first piece may already have become asur.
- The Gemara concludes that the machlokes is connected to efshar l’sochto, not merely min b’mino.
- The Mishnah requires tearing the udder and removing its milk, and similarly tearing the heart to remove its blood.
- The Gemara discusses two versions of Rav regarding an udder that was cooked without being torn.
- A Beraisa supports the lenient view that the milk inside the udder is permitted.
- Milk found inside a calf after nursing is different because it already left the mother.
- Rav Yehudah says the udder is torn lengthwise and crosswise and pressed against the wall.
- Yalta teaches that the Torah provides permitted equivalents to forbidden tastes, and asks Rav Nachman for the permitted equivalent of Basar b’chalav — the udder.

📘 **Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:**

https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk

📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download

🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל