Chullin 103 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Eiver Min HaChai vs Basar Min HaChai

Gemara:

👉 Two separate concepts:

Eiver min hachai:

- A complete limb taken from a living animal
- Includes meat, sinews and bones

Basar min hachai:

- A piece of meat taken from a living animal
- Even without a complete limb

2️⃣ Rebbe Yochanan – Sources

👉 Rebbe Yochanan learns:

From one pasuk:

- Eiver min hachai

From “U’basar basadeh treifah”:

- Basar min hachai
- Basar min hatreifah

👉 Therefore:

- These prohibitions come from different pesukim

3️⃣ Reish Lakish – Sources

👉 Reish Lakish learns differently:

From the pasuk of eiver min hachai:

- Eiver min hachai
- Basar min hachai

From “U’basar basadeh treifah”:

- Basar from a treifah

4️⃣ How Many Malkus?

👉 This difference affects:

- Whether eating combinations of these prohibitions creates one or two liabilities

👉 If the prohibitions come from:

- Separate pesukim → potentially two
- The same pasuk → only one

5️⃣ Eiver Min HaChai + Treifah

👉 If someone eats:

- Eiver min hachai
- From a treifah

👉 These come from:

- Two separate pesukim

👉 Yet Reish Lakish says:

- In certain cases he is liable only once

6️⃣ One Animal vs Two Animals

👉 Rav Yosef explains:

From two animals:

- Liable twice

From one animal:

- Machlokes whether both prohibitions can take effect

7️⃣ When Does Eiver Min HaChai Take Effect?

👉 Abaye explains the machlokes depends on:

- Whether a living animal is already viewed as standing to be divided into limbs

If yes:

- Eiver min hachai exists from birth

If no:

- It only takes effect later when the limb is actually separated

---

📌 **Why This Matters**

👉 If the animal was born a treifah:

- Treifah and eiver min hachai may take effect simultaneously

👉 Or:

- Treifah may come first
- Creating a question of ein issur chal al issur

8️⃣ **Eiver Min HaChai as a Stronger Issur**

👉 Another explanation:

- Everyone may agree eiver min hachai comes later

👉 Nevertheless:

- Eiver min hachai is a stronger prohibition

👉 Reason:

- It already applied to Bnei Noach

👉 Therefore:

- It may take effect even on top of the existing prohibition of treifah

---

9️⃣ **Alternative – Treifah Comes Later**

👉 Another possibility:

- Eiver min hachai exists first
- The animal becomes a treifah later

👉 Machlokes:

- Can the later issur of treifah take effect on the existing issur?

🔟 Rav's Explanation

👉 Rav gives another case:

- Someone tears a limb from the animal
- That same action makes the animal a treifah

👉 Therefore:

- Eiver min hachai and treifah take effect simultaneously

1️⃣1️⃣ Chelev from a Living Treifah

👉 New case:

Someone eats chelev from an animal that is:

- Alive
- A treifah

👉 Potential prohibitions:

- Chelev
- Eiver/Basar min hachai
- Treifah

📌 How Many?

👉 One version:

- Liable for two

👉 Another version in the name of Rebbe Yochanan:

- Liable for all three

1️⃣2️⃣ Same Question Again

👉 The Gemara again discusses:

- Which prohibition came first?
- Did they take effect simultaneously?
- Can one issur take effect on another?

👉 The same principles from the previous sugya are applied here.

1️⃣3️⃣ Treifah Taking Effect on Chelev

👉 The Torah specifically discusses:

- Chelev of a neveilah
- Chelev of a treifah

👉 This shows:

- Treifah can sometimes take effect even when the chelev was already forbidden

---

📌 Limitation

👉 Chelev may be a special case:

- Because chelev is permitted in a chayah

👉 Therefore:

- It may not prove the general rule for every prohibition

1️⃣4️⃣ Splitting a Kezayis

👉 New sugya:

Someone has:

- One kezayis of eiver min hachai

👉 He divides it:

- Half a kezayis
- Then another half

👉 Question:

- Do the two halves combine for liability?

1️⃣5️⃣ Rebbe Yochanan vs Reish Lakish

👉 The discussion depends on what defines eating:

Rebbe Yochanan:

- Hana'as grono – benefit/taste in the throat

Reish Lakish:

- Achilas me'av – the food must enter the digestive system

1️⃣6️⃣ Dividing It Outside the Mouth

👉 Rebbe Yochanan initially says:

- If the kezayis was divided outside the mouth and eaten separately, he is patur

👉 Reish Lakish:

- Holds the pieces can still combine

👉 The halacha follows:

- Reish Lakish in this case

1️⃣7️⃣ Food Between the Teeth

👉 If part of the kezayis remains:

- Between the teeth

👉 It may not count toward the required amount.

1️⃣8️⃣ Food on the Palate

👉 The Gemara distinguishes between:

- Food stuck between the teeth
- Food touching the palate/throat

👉 Reason:

- The palate is part of the normal enjoyment of eating

1️⃣9️⃣ Eating, Vomiting & Eating Again

👉 Rebbe Yochanan says:

Someone:

- Eats half a kezayis
- Vomits it
- Then eats another half

👉 He can be liable.

📌 Reason

👉 In total:

- His throat benefited from a full kezayis

👉 The focus according to Rebbe Yochanan is:

- Hana'as grono

2️⃣0️⃣ Eating the Same Kezayis Twice

👉 Rav Asi discusses an even stronger case:

- Someone eats a full kezayis
- Vomits it
- Eats the same kezayis again

👉 He can potentially be liable:

- Twice

👉 This shows:

- Vomiting does not undo the first act of eating
- The same food can create another act of eating when eaten again

---

2️⃣ 1️⃣ Rav Asi & Rebbe Elazar

👉 Rebbe Elazar questioned Rav Asi about this halacha.

👉 Rav Asi did not initially respond.

👉 Rebbe Elazar respectfully reminded him:

- Rav Asi himself had previously stated this ruling before Rebbe Yochanan
- Rebbe Yochanan agreed with it

2️⃣ 2️⃣ Hadran Alach Gid Hanasheh

👉 The daf concludes:

- Perek Gid Hanasheh

👉 Hadran Alach Gid Hanasheh!

2️⃣ 3️⃣ Final Points

- Eiver min hachai and basar min hachai are separate concepts
- Rebbe Yochanan and Reish Lakish disagree about their sources
- This affects how many prohibitions a person can violate
- Timing is crucial when multiple issurim apply
- The Gemara repeatedly analyzes ein issur chal al issur
- Eiver min hachai may be stronger because it applied to Bnei Noach
- Chelev, treifah and min hachai can potentially overlap
- Meat, bones and sinews are important when measuring eiver min hachai
- Rebbe Yochanan focuses on benefit in the throat, while Reish Lakish focuses on the food entering the digestive system
- Even eating the same food again after vomiting can potentially create a second liability
- The daf completes Perek Gid Hanasheh

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:

https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk

📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon): https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download

🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor

לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל