# Bechoros 9 – Good Morning Raboisai

## 1️⃣ Rebbe Yehoshua and the Sages of Athens Continue

👉 The Daf continues the famous encounter between Rebbe Yehoshua ben Chananya and the sixty Sages of Athens.

They challenge him with a series of strange questions. Although the questions appear unusual, the shiur notes that there are deeper explanations given by the Maharal and others. 9_shiur

---

## 2️⃣ Why Lend Money Again?

👉 They ask:

A person lent money and had tremendous difficulty:

- Collecting the debt.

Why would he ever:

- Lend money again?

Rebbe Yehoshua compares it to someone who goes to a swamp to:

- Cut reeds.

He cuts more than he can carry. While waiting for someone to help transport them:

- He cuts even more.

👉 Once he is continuing with the business, he hopes that further success will:

- Make up for his earlier difficulty or loss.

---

## 3️⃣ The Mule That Gave Birth

👉 They challenge him with an impossible story:

A mule:

- Gave birth

and the offspring had a document around its neck stating:

- An enormous debt was owed.

Rebbe Yehoshua immediately exposes the contradiction:

- A mule cannot give birth.

The entire premise:

- Cannot be true.

---

## 4️⃣ How Do You Preserve Salt?

👉 They ask:

How can you prevent:

- Salt from spoiling?

He answers:

- With the placenta of a mule.

But:

- A mule does not give birth and therefore has no placenta.

And:

- Salt itself does not spoil.

👉 He answers their impossible question with:

- An equally impossible answer.

---

## 5️⃣ Build Us a House in Midair

👉 They tell Rebbe Yehoshua:

- Build us a house in the air.

He says Hashem's Name and rises:

- Into the air.

He then tells them:

- Bring me the bricks and mortar.

Since they cannot:

- Get the materials up to him,

they cannot expect him to:

- Build the house.

---

## 6️⃣ Where Is the Centre of the World?

👉 They ask:

Where is:

- The centre of the world?

Rebbe Yehoshua points to:

- A particular spot.

When they demand proof, he tells them:

- Bring measuring ropes and measure the entire world.

If they cannot prove otherwise:

- They cannot challenge his answer.

---

## 7️⃣ Bring the Well into the City

👉 They tell him:

We have a well outside the city.

- Bring it into the city.

He tells them:

- Make me a rope from weak material and I will pull it in.

The challenge itself is impossible without:

- The proper tools.

👉 The shiur brings out the idea that bringing Kedushah into one's life also requires:

- The proper Keilim.

---

## 8️⃣ Sew Up a Broken Millstone

👉 They show him:

- A broken millstone

and tell him:

- Sew it together.

Rebbe Yehoshua answers:

- Make me a thread from stone, and I will sew it.

Again:

- An impossible request receives an impossible condition.

---

## 9️⃣ A Field That Grows Knives

👉 They ask:

How do you harvest:

- A field that grows knives?

He answers:

- With the horn of a donkey.

They object:

- A donkey has no horn!

He responds:

- Neither is there a field that grows knives.

---

## 🔟 Which Egg Came from Which Chicken?

👉 They bring him:

- Two identical eggs

and ask:

Which came from:

- A black chicken

and which from:

- A white chicken?

Rebbe Yehoshua brings:

- Two pieces of cheese

and asks them:

Which came from:

- A black goat

and which from:

- A white goat?

If they cannot distinguish his:

- Two cheeses,

they cannot demand that he distinguish their:

- Two eggs.

---

## 1️⃣1️⃣ Where Does the Ruach Leave an Egg?

👉 They ask:

If a chick dies inside its egg:

- Where does its Ruach leave?

Rebbe Yehoshua answers:

- From the same place it entered.

If they accept that the Ruach:

- Entered,

there is no greater difficulty understanding how it:

- Left.

---

## 1️⃣2️⃣ Something That Costs More to Use Than It Is Worth

👉 They ask him to show them an object where:

- Using it costs more than the object itself.

He brings a large:

- Reed mat.

When opened, it cannot fit:

- Through the doorway.

To bring it inside, one would have to:

- Break and rebuild the entrance.

👉 The cost of using it is therefore:

- Greater than its own value.

---

# Rebbe Yehoshua Defeats the Sages

## 1️⃣3️⃣ Sixty Sages – Sixty Rooms

👉 Rebbe Yehoshua has now defeated them.

He brings each Sage separately onto:

- The ship prepared by the Caesar.

Each enters a room containing:

- Sixty seats.

Seeing the empty seats, each assumes:

- His friends will soon join him.

Instead:

- Each Sage is placed separately.

Once all sixty are aboard:

- The ship sails away.

---

## 1️⃣4️⃣ The Soil of Athens

👉 Before leaving Athens, Rebbe Yehoshua takes:

- Some of its earth.

When the Sages eventually arrive before the Caesar, they are:

- Weak
- Depressed
- And unusually quiet.

The Caesar says:

- These cannot be the famous Sages of Athens.

Rebbe Yehoshua gives them:

- The scent of their native soil.

They regain:

- Their confidence and character.

They immediately begin speaking disrespectfully to:

- The Caesar.

---

## 1️⃣5️⃣ The Vessel That Could Never Be Filled

👉 The Caesar gives Rebbe Yehoshua permission to:

- Deal with them.

The shiur describes special water that:

- Swallows other water poured into it.

The Sages are told:

- Fill the enormous vessel and you can leave.

They keep pouring water in:

- But it continually disappears.

They work until:

- They are exhausted.

Eventually:

- They themselves are swallowed as well.

This concludes the lengthy story of:

- Rebbe Yehoshua ben Chananya and the Sages of Athens.

---

# New Mishnah – Petor Chamor

## 1️⃣6️⃣ A Safek Firstborn Donkey

👉 The Mishnah returns to:

- Petor Chamor.

Normally, the firstborn male donkey must be redeemed with:

- A Seh.

But suppose a donkey gives birth to:

- A male and a female

and we do not know:

- Which was born first.

If the male came first:

- There is a Chiyuv Petor Chamor.

If the female came first:

- There is no Chiyuv.

Because it is a Safek:

- The Kohen cannot demand the Seh.

Instead:

- מפריש טלה אחד לעצמו

The owner separates a Seh:

- For himself.

---

## 1️⃣7️⃣ What Does Separating the Seh Accomplish?

👉 Although the Kohen cannot demand the sheep because:

- Hamotzi Mechaveiro Alav HaRaayah,

the possible Petor Chamor still requires:

- Redemption.

Therefore, the owner separates:

- A sheep.

He does not have to give it to:

- The Kohen.

Once the redemption is performed:

- He may keep the sheep himself.

---

## 1️⃣8️⃣ Two Donkey Mothers

👉 The Mishnah gives several variations involving:

- Two donkeys giving birth.

If both definitely produce:

- Firstborn males,

the owner gives:

- Two sheep to the Kohen.

If only one is definitely obligated:

- He gives one.

Where there is an additional Safek:

- He separates another Seh for himself.

If both are doubtful:

- The necessary sheep are separated for redemption

but the Kohen cannot demand them without:

- Proof.

---

## 1️⃣9️⃣ What Can Be Used for Petor Chamor?

👉 The Torah says:

- ופטר חמור תפדה בשה

A Petor Chamor is redeemed with:

- A Seh.

The Mishnah teaches that this includes:

- A sheep or goat
- Male or female
- Large or small
- Tamim or Baal Mum.

Why?

Because the Seh used for Petor Chamor does not acquire:

- Korban Kedushah.

---

## 2️⃣0️⃣ The Same Seh Can Be Used Again

👉 A single Seh can even be used to redeem:

- Multiple Petor Chamorim at different times.

After using it for redemption:

- It belongs to the Kohen.

If the owner later:

- Buys it back
- Or receives it back as a gift,

he can use:

- The same Seh again.

There is no inherent Kedushah in:

- The Seh itself.

---

# Can Two Animals Be Born at Exactly the Same Time?

## 2️⃣1️⃣ Efshar Letzamtzem

👉 The Gemara discusses the famous question:

Can two offspring emerge:

- At precisely the same moment?

Rebbe Yosi HaGelili holds:

- אפשר לצמצם

It is possible for two births to occur:

- Simultaneously.

This matters because if two males are born at exactly the same time:

- Both could potentially have the status of Bechor.

---

## 2️⃣2️⃣ Two Firstborn Donkeys

👉 A Beraisa discusses a donkey that gives birth to:

- Two males

whose heads emerge:

- At the same time.

According to Rebbe Yosi HaGelili:

- Both require redemption.

This creates a difficulty with the suggestion that simultaneous birth applies only to:

- Kosher Bechor animals.

The Beraisa explicitly applies the concept to:

- Petor Chamor as well.

---

## 2️⃣3️⃣ Does One Twin Block the Other?

👉 The Gemara then asks:

If two offspring emerge together, each one is touching only:

- Part of the womb.

The other offspring is blocking:

- Part of the opening.

Perhaps each twin should therefore create a:

- Chatzitzah

for the other.

The discussion connects with the concept that:

- Min B'Mino Eino Chotzetz

something of the same type may not constitute:

- A Chatzitzah.

---

# Is a Petor Chamor Assur B’Hanaah?

## 2️⃣4️⃣ Why Separate a Sheep for Yourself?

👉 The Mishnah says that in a Safek case:

- Mafresh Taleh Echad L’atzmo.

The Gemara asks:

What is accomplished by separating:

- The sheep?

This suggests that until redemption, the donkey itself may be:

- Assur B’Hanaah.

Otherwise, why would the owner need to:

- Redeem it at all?

---

## 2️⃣5️⃣ Rebbe Yehudah and Rebbe Shimon

👉 This leads to a Machlokes:

Rebbe Yehudah holds:

- A Petor Chamor is Assur B’Hanaah before redemption.

Rebbe Shimon holds:

- It is permitted to benefit from the donkey even before redemption.

According to Rebbe Yehudah:

- The redemption removes the Issur Hanaah.

---

## 2️⃣6️⃣ Why Specifically a Seh?

👉 The Gemara asks:

If redemption is required, why does the Torah specifically tell us to use:

- A Seh?

Petor Chamor can also be redeemed with:

- Other items of value.

The special advantage of a Seh is:

- It does not have to equal the donkey's value.

A donkey worth far more can still be redeemed with:

- A relatively inexpensive Seh.

But when redeeming with other property:

- The full value must be given.

---

## 2️⃣7️⃣ Kiddushin with Maaser Sheni

👉 The Gemara compares this with:

- Maaser Sheni.

The Torah normally requires Maaser Sheni to be redeemed onto:

- Money with a Tzurah – a minted coin.

Yet there can still be monetary value in:

- The Maaser itself.

The Gemara discusses a woman being Mekudeshes with:

- Maaser Sheni

and compares this to:

- Petor Chamor.

---

## 2️⃣8️⃣ Kiddushin with a Petor Chamor

👉 Even according to the view that a Petor Chamor is:

- Assur B'Hanaah before redemption,

it can still have monetary significance.

The woman can:

- Redeem the donkey with a cheaper Seh

and retain the difference between:

- The value of the donkey
- And the value of the Seh.

That remaining value can therefore provide:

- Monetary value for Kiddushin.

---

# 📌 Key Chazarah

- Rebbe Yehoshua ben Chananya completes his contest with the sixty Sages of Athens and brings them to the Caesar.
- Their strange challenges are repeatedly answered by exposing the flaw in the question or answering an impossible request with an impossible condition.
- The new Mishnah discusses Safek Petor Chamor.
- In a Safek, the owner may have to separate a Seh even though the Kohen cannot demand it.
- A Seh for Petor Chamor may be male or female, large or small, Tamim or Baal Mum.
- The Seh itself does not acquire Korban Kedushah.
- The same Seh can be used again if it returns to the owner after a previous redemption.
- Rebbe Yosi HaGelili holds Efshar Letzamtzem – two offspring can emerge at precisely the same time.
- The Gemara discusses whether twins emerging together create a Chatzitzah for one another.
- Rebbe Yehudah holds a Petor Chamor is Assur B'Hanaah before redemption; Rebbe Shimon permits Hanaah.
- A Seh can redeem a Petor Chamor even when worth much less than the donkey.
- Other items used for redemption must equal the donkey's full value.

- The Gemara compares Petor Chamor with Maaser Sheni and discusses their monetary value for Kiddushin.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל