Bechoros 60 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Minyan HaRa'ui – The Key Principle

The Daf continues the rules of Ma'aser Behemah when animals leave a pen through more than one opening.

A major principle is Minyan HaRa'ui: if, when an animal leaves, there was a viable group from which a full count of ten could have been completed, that animal can become exempt even if the count was ultimately not completed in that direction.

👉 Once an animal has this p'tur, it may be eaten or sold. Animals that never received a p'tur must later join another group for Ma'aser.

2️⃣ Fourteen Animals – Six Leave One Side, Four the Other

There are 14 animals in a pen with two openings.

Six leave through one opening. At that stage there was a Minyan HaRa'ui, because the remaining animals could potentially complete the ten with them.

Four then leave through the other opening, leaving four inside.

If the final four join the six, there are ten and one is taken as Ma'aser.

If the final four instead join the other four, those eight have not completed a valid count and must later join another Goren.

👉 The original six remain patur because they already had Minyan HaRa'ui.

3️⃣ Four Leave One Door and Six the Other

In another case, four leave one opening and six leave the other, with four remaining inside.

When the first four left, ten remained available.

When the six left, there was also a potential valid Minyan.

If the final four join the six, they form ten and Ma'aser can be taken.

But if the final four join the original four, something unusual happens:

👉 The first four had already obtained a p'tur through Minyan HaRa'ui, while the later four did not.

The latter four therefore need to join another Goren.

4️⃣ Four Leave Each Side

If four animals leave through each of the two openings, six remain inside.

Both original groups had a potential Minyan.

The six can subsequently complete a group on either side.

The case demonstrates that Minyan HaRa'ui can operate even where there are multiple possible directions in which the remaining animals could go.

5️⃣ The Chiddush – Even With Two Doors

One might have thought that Minyan HaRa'ui only works where there is one opening and therefore a definite path for the animals.

With two openings, perhaps we should say that there was never a true Minyan HaRa'ui because the remaining animals might go through the other door.

The Daf teaches otherwise.

👉 Even when some animals could potentially go one way and others the other way, the possibility of completing the Minyan can still create the p'tur.

6️⃣ Fifteen Animals – Bring All Fifteen

Rava discusses someone who owns 15 animals.

One might think he should simply select ten, put those ten into the pen, and perform Ma'aser Behemah.

Rava says not to do this.

All 15 are brought into the pen.

Ten leave and Ma'aser is taken from those ten.

The five remaining animals, however, have not received a permanent p'tur.

👉 They must later join another five animals and begin a new Goren.

Merely being present in the pen while the first ten were counted does not exempt them.

7️⃣ The Contradiction From Nineteen Animals

A Beraisa discusses someone with 19 animals.

It says that he should place all 19 into the pen, allow ten to leave, take Ma'aser, and:

V'HaShe'ar Peturim – the remainder are exempt.

But Rava just taught that with 15 animals, the five left behind must later join another Goren.

Why should the nine remaining from 19 be patur?

8️⃣ Rav Huna Bar Sechora's Brilliant Answer

Rav Huna Bar Sechora answered this question before Rava during the public Yom Tov drasha.

The case of 19 involves a pen with two openings.

Nine animals went through one opening and nine through the other, leaving one animal in the pen.

That final animal could potentially have joined either side.

Therefore:

👉 Each group of nine had a Minyan HaRa'ui.

All 18 animals that left therefore received a p'tur.

This resolves the contradiction.

9️⃣ Why This Answer Was So Sharp

The Gemara considers other possible explanations for the Beraisa.

Perhaps the owner counted nine animals and then accidentally restarted his count, eventually calling the nineteenth animal "ten."

But Rav Huna Bar Sechora could not use this explanation because he knew Rava's principle:

👉 The tenth animal can become Kadosh automatically despite the owner's mistaken counting.

The owner cannot simply prevent the true tenth animal from becoming Ma'aser by restarting his numbers.

🔟 Counting Animals in Pairs

Another possibility is that the animals left in pairs.

The owner might count each pair as a single number:

Two animals = “one”

Another two = “two”

and so on.

But again, the Kedushah does not simply wait until the owner eventually reaches the word “ten.”

The actual rules of Ma’aser determine when the Kedushah takes effect.

This further demonstrates why Rav Huna Bar Sechora’s two-door explanation was the correct answer.

1️⃣1️⃣ Rav Huna Bar Sechora Becomes Famous

Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak praised Rav Huna Bar Sechora for being able to give this answer during Rava’s public Yom Tov shiur.

He understood both:

👉 the principle of Minyan HaRa’ui;

👉 and Rava’s rule concerning when the tenth animal becomes Kadosh.

Rashi explains that through this episode his reputation spread – Yatza Tiv’o.

1️⃣2️⃣ Two Animals Leave Together

The Mishnah discusses what happens when two animals leave the pen simultaneously.

Normally, each animal must receive its own number.

For example, if animals six and seven leave together, they should still be counted separately as six and seven.

If the owner instead treats two animals as one number, the count can become corrupted.

1️⃣3️⃣ The Famous 9–10–11 Mistake

A classic Ma’aser Behemah case occurs when the owner miscounts:

The ninth animal is called “ten.”

The tenth is called “nine.”

The eleventh is then called “ten.”

All three can acquire Kedushah, but not in the same way.

👉 Number 9, mistakenly called ten, receives Kedushah.

👉 Number 10 is the actual Ma’aser Behemah.

👉 Number 11, mistakenly called ten, becomes a Shelamim.

This is the special Torah rule of a mistaken Ma’aser count.

1️⃣4️⃣ An Accidental Counting Problem Is Different

The Daf distinguishes between a genuine mistaken designation and a case where two animals simply came out together.

When someone makes an actual counting mistake – calling nine “ten,” for example – the special rules of Ta’us Ma’aser apply.

But where two animals leave together and the count becomes confused through the physical circumstances, it is treated differently.

👉 Not every disrupted count creates the special Kedushah of Ta’us Ma’aser.

1️⃣5️⃣ Is Number Eleven a Temurah?

Why does animal number eleven become a Shelamim when it is mistakenly called “ten”?

One possibility is that it is effectively replacing the real tenth animal and therefore resembles Temurah.

But Rebbi Meir demonstrates that number eleven cannot simply be ordinary Temurah.

Why?

A Temurah of Ma’aser cannot be offered normally on the Mizbe’ach.

Yet this number eleven is brought as a Shelamim.

👉 Therefore its Kedushah is a special law of Ma’aser Behemah rather than ordinary Temurah.

1️⃣6️⃣ When Number Eleven Cannot Become Kadosh

Suppose the owner correctly calls the real tenth animal “ten.”

He then also calls the eleventh animal “ten.”

The eleventh does NOT become Kadosh.

Why?

Once the actual tenth animal was correctly designated, that group is finished.

Animal eleven is effectively the first animal of a new count.

👉 You cannot simply call animal number one “ten” and make it Ma’aser.

The special mistake involving number eleven only works where the count around the true tenth animal was itself disturbed.

1️⃣7️⃣ What Determines “Ten”?

The Daf discusses what happens when the owner counts in an unusual fashion.

For example, he might count animals in pairs, calling every pair one number.

What determines the tenth?

Is it:

👉 the tenth number spoken by the owner;

or

👉 the actual tenth animal to leave the pen?

This becomes a Machlokes.

One view focuses on the owner’s counting, while Rav Kahana focuses on the actual number of animals leaving.

1️⃣8️⃣ Counting Backwards

The discussion extends to unusual counting systems.

What if someone counts backwards instead of forwards?

The question again becomes whether Kedushas Ma'aser follows the actual tenth animal or the number the owner assigns during his count.

This highlights an important issue running through the Daf:

👉 How much does Ma'aser Behemah depend on the owner's declaration, and how much occurs automatically through the Torah's counting system?

1️⃣ 9️⃣ Why Only 9 and 11?

The Torah says:

"Ha'Asiri Yihyeh Kodesh" – the tenth shall be holy.

From the Pesukim, Chazal derive that a mistaken designation can also become Kadosh.

But this does not extend indefinitely.

You cannot call animal eight or twelve "ten" and automatically give it the special Kedushah.

The mistake must be adjacent to the true tenth.

👉 The relevant animals are therefore nine, ten and eleven.

2️⃣ 0️⃣ Can Both 9 and 11 Become Kadosh?

Rebbi Elazar b'Rebbi Shimon limits the rule further.

Animal eleven does not become Kadosh unless the owner remained silent regarding number nine and then made the mistake with number eleven.

According to this approach, the mistaken animal is similar to Temurah.

Since one animal cannot generate multiple independent Temuros in this manner, there can only be one mistaken designation surrounding the actual Ma'aser.

👉 Either the mistake occurs with number nine or with number eleven – not both.

📌 **Key Chazarah**

• Minyan HaRa'ui can create a p'tur even when a full group of ten is not ultimately formed in that direction.

• This principle can apply even where a pen has two openings.

• With 15 animals, after ten complete Ma’aser, the five remaining must later join another Goren.

• The Beraisa’s 19-animal case is explained through two doors: nine leave each side and the final animal creates a Minyan HaRa’ui for both groups.

• Rav Huna Bar Sechora’s explanation became famous because it correctly combined Minyan HaRa’ui with Rava’s rules of Ma’aser counting.

• Two animals leaving together can disrupt the count and is not necessarily equivalent to an ordinary mistaken designation.

• In the classic 9–10–11 mistake, all three can receive Kedushah: 9 through the mistaken call, 10 as the true Ma’aser, and 11 as a Shelamim.

• If the true tenth animal is correctly called ten, number eleven cannot subsequently be made Kadosh merely by also calling it ten.

• The Daf discusses whether Kedushah follows the owner’s spoken count or the actual number of animals leaving.

• The special rule of mistaken Ma’aser applies only close to the true tenth animal.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל