Bechoros 58 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Three Granos for Ma'aser Behemah

The Mishnah teaches that there are:

👉 Shalosh Granos – three designated periods during the year for Ma'aser Behemah.

The word Goren is borrowed from produce. Just as produce reaches a stage when Ma'aser must be dealt with:

👉 Chazal established three times during the year when a person should separate Ma'aser Behemah from the animals born since the previous Goren.

These times are connected to:

👉 Pesach
👉 Shavuos
👉 Sukkos

2️⃣ Can You Eat an Animal Before Ma'aser?

There is a major difference between:

👉 Ma'aser of produce

and:

👉 Ma'aser Behemah.

Produce that has reached its obligation but has not been tithed can become:

👉 Tevel – prohibited to eat.

Ma'aser Behemah is different.

Rashi explains:

👉 Fundamentally, before the Goren arrives, the owner may shecht and eat an animal even though he has not yet separated Ma'aser Behemah.

The obligation is:

👉 A Mitzvah to designate every tenth animal.

Once the designated Goren arrives, however:

👉 Chazal said he should not shecht or sell the animals before taking Ma'aser.

When Are the Three Granos?

3️⃣ Rebbi Akiva – Fifteen Days Before

According to Rebbi Akiva, the three Granos are:

👉 Pras HaPesach
👉 Pras HaAtzeres
👉 Pras HaChag

Pras means:

👉 Half.

The normal period discussed before a Yom Tov is thirty days.

Half of thirty is:

👉 Fifteen days.

Therefore, according to Rebbi Akiva:

👉 Ma'aser Behemah is separated fifteen days before each of the three Regalim.

4️⃣ Why Doesn't Rebbi Akiva Give a Date Before Pesach?

Fifteen days before Pesach can fall on:

👉 The 29th or 30th of Adar,

depending on the length of the month.

Therefore, Rebbi Akiva does not give:

👉 One fixed calendar date.

He simply says:

👉 Fifteen days before Pesach.

5️⃣ Ben Azai's Dates

Ben Azai gives specific dates:

👉 29 Adar
👉 1 Sivan
👉 29 Av

His dates differ from Rebbi Akiva because:

👉 He calculates the Granos differently.

In particular, the Shavuos Goren is pushed much closer to Shavuos.

6️⃣ Why So Close to Shavuos?

There are only:

👉 Fifty days between Pesach and Shavuos.

If Ma'aser were taken fifteen days before Shavuos:

👉 There would be a very short period for additional animals to be born after the Pesach Goren.

Therefore:

👉 The Shavuos Goren is pushed closer to Shavuos.

This allows:

👉 More newborn animals to accumulate.

7️⃣ Rebbi Elazar and Rebbi Shimon

Rebbi Elazar and Rebbi Shimon give another set of dates:

👉 1 Nissan
👉 1 Sivan
👉 29 Elul

Why 29 Elul rather than:

👉 1 Tishrei?

Because 1 Tishrei is:

👉 Rosh Hashanah – Yom Tov.

During the Ma'aser process the tenth animal is normally:

👉 Marked with red paint.

Painting cannot be done on Yom Tov.

Therefore:

👉 The Goren is moved to 29 Elul.

Why Before the Regalim?

8️⃣ Animals for the Olei Regalim

Why did Chazal establish these periods around:

👉 Pesach, Shavuos and Sukkos?

Because large numbers of people would come to Yerushalayim:

👉 For Aliyah LaRegel.

They needed animals:

👉 For Korbanos and for food.

Chazal therefore wanted animals to become available:

👉 Before the crowds arrived.

9️⃣ The Owner Wants to Perform the Mitzvah First

Before the Goren:

👉 An owner could technically sell or shecht his animals.

But a Yid would prefer:

👉 To first perform the Mitzvah of Ma'aser Behemah.

Once the tenth animal becomes Ma'aser:

👉 He brings it to Yerushalayim and eats it there.

The Daf notes an additional benefit:

👉 The owner can eat the animal without the ordinary Matnos Kehunah obligation applying in the usual way.

So he gains:

👉 A Mitzvah without losing the animal.

Rosh Hashanah for Ma’aser Behemah

🔟 **Rebbi Meir – 1 Elul**

We now come to a different issue:

👉 When does the Ma’aser Behemah year begin?

According to Rebbi Meir:

👉 1 Elul is Rosh Hashanah for Ma’aser Behemah.

Therefore:

👉 Animals born before 1 Elul belong to one Ma’aser year.

👉 Animals born from 1 Elul onward belong to the next.

Animals from the two years:

👉 Cannot combine.

1️⃣1️⃣ **Rebbi Elazar and Rebbi Shimon – 1 Tishrei**

According to Rebbi Elazar and Rebbi Shimon:

👉 1 Tishrei is Rosh Hashanah for Ma’aser Behemah.

Therefore:

👉 Elul still belongs to the previous year.

The new Ma’aser year begins:

👉 On Rosh Hashanah.

Ben Azai – Elul Stands Alone

1️⃣2️⃣ **Elulim Mis’asrin Bifnei Atzman**

Ben Azai is unsure which tradition is correct:

👉 Is Rosh Hashanah for Ma’aser Behemah 1 Elul?

or:

👉 1 Tishrei?

Therefore, he rules:

👉 Animals born during Elul are tithed separately.

They do not combine with:

👉 Animals born in Av.

And they do not combine with:

👉 Animals born in Tishrei.

Elul becomes:

👉 Its own separate category.

1️⃣3️⃣ Why Couldn't Ben Azai Decide?

The Gemara asks:

Ben Azai was an extraordinary Talmid Chacham.

Why couldn't he simply analyze the opinions and decide:

👉 Which one made more sense?

Rebbi Yochanan answers:

👉 Mipi HaShemuah Amruha.

The dates were based on:

👉 A received tradition.

They were not based simply on:

👉 A logical argument that Ben Azai could weigh and decide.

Therefore:

👉 He treated Elul separately to satisfy both possibilities.

Crossing a Goren Is Not a New Year

1️⃣4️⃣ Five Before and Five After a Goren

Suppose:

👉 Five animals are born before one of the three Granos.

👉 Five are born afterwards.

Can they combine?

👉 Yes.

The Goren does not create:

👉 A new Ma’aser year.

It merely establishes:

👉 The time when Ma’aser should be taken.

Therefore, animals on opposite sides of a Goren:

👉 Can still combine if they belong to the same Ma’aser year.

1️⃣5️⃣ Crossing Rosh Hashanah Is Different

But suppose:

👉 Five animals are born before Rosh Hashanah for Ma’aser Behemah.

👉 Five are born afterwards.

They cannot combine.

Why?

Because:

👉 Chodosh and Yashan – animals from different Ma’aser years – cannot be joined together.

So we have an important distinction:

👉 Goren = timing for separating Ma’aser.

👉 Rosh Hashanah = division between two Ma’aser years.

Rava’s Solution for Elul

1️⃣6️⃣ Five – Five – Five

Ben Azai creates a practical problem.

Suppose someone has:

👉 Five animals from Av.

👉 Five animals from Elul.

👉 Five animals from Tishrei.

The Elul animals:

👉 Cannot simply combine with either side because we do not know whether the year changed at the beginning or end of Elul.

Rava gives a clever solution.

1️⃣7️⃣ Whichever Way You Look at It

The five Av animals and five Tishrei animals:

👉 Definitely cannot combine with each other.

But the five Elul animals must belong:

👉 Either with Av

or:

👉 With Tishrei.

Therefore:

👉 They can be counted in a carefully arranged way so that the tenth animal comes from the Elul group.

Whichever Rosh Hashanah is correct:

👉 The Elul animal can become the valid Ma’aser.

1️⃣8️⃣ Counting While the Animals Are Stationary

Normally we picture Ma’aser Behemah as:

👉 Animals leaving a pen one by one.

But Rava's solution relies on another Halachah:

👉 Counting can work even when the animals are stationary.

If the animals are:

👉 Revutzim – lying or standing in place,

the owner can still count them and designate the tenth.

This is not the ideal procedure:

👉 But the Ma’aser is valid.

This allows him to make sure:

👉 The tenth comes from the Elul group.

How Ma’aser Behemah Is Normally Performed

1️⃣9️⃣ The Pen

The Mishnah describes the normal procedure.

The owner gathers the animals:

👉 Into a pen.

He creates:

👉 A small opening through which they can leave one at a time.

He counts:

👉 One, two, three…

until:

👉 The tenth emerges.

2️⃣0️⃣ Marking the Tenth Animal

When the tenth animal emerges:

👉 The owner marks it with red paint.

He declares:

👉 This is Ma’aser.

The marking makes the Ma’aser animal:

👉 Easily identifiable.

But the Daf teaches:

👉 The paint itself is not Me’akev.

2️⃣1️⃣ What if He Didn't Use a Staff or Paint?

Suppose the owner:

👉 Did not mark the animal.

Or:

👉 Did not count them in the ideal manner.

Or even:

👉 Counted them while they were sitting or standing rather than passing through the opening.

The Ma’aser can nevertheless:

👉 Take effect.

The normal procedure is the proper way to perform the Mitzvah:

👉 But these details do not necessarily invalidate it.

When an Animal Jumps Back Into the Pen

2️⃣2️⃣ A Counted Animal Jumps Back

Suppose animals are leaving the pen and being counted.

Then:

👉 One animal that was already counted jumps back inside.

Now there is a serious problem:

👉 The owner no longer knows which animals have already been counted.

He might count:

👉 The same animal twice.

The remaining animals therefore:

👉 Cannot simply continue through the normal count.

2️⃣ 3️⃣ What if the Ma’aser Animal Jumps Back?

An even greater problem occurs if:

👉 An animal already designated as Ma’aser jumps back into the flock.

Now a Kadosh animal:

👉 Is mixed with ordinary animals.

The owner cannot simply eat the flock because:

👉 One of them is Ma’aser Behemah.

The Daf indicates that the animals must be handled appropriately:

👉 Until the Ma’aser animal can be dealt with through a Mum.

📌 Key Chazarah

- There are three Granos during the year for separating Ma’aser Behemah.
- Fundamentally, Ma’aser Behemah is not like Tevel; before the Goren the owner can shecht an animal without first taking Ma’aser.
- Once the Goren arrives, Chazal said not to shecht or sell before separating Ma’aser.
- Rebbi Akiva sets the Granos fifteen days before Pesach, Shavuos and Sukkos.
- Ben Azai gives the dates 29 Adar, 1 Sivan and 29 Av.
- Rebbi Elazar and Rebbi Shimon give 1 Nissan, 1 Sivan and 29 Elul.
- The Shavuos date is close to Shavuos because there is little time for animals to be born between Pesach and Shavuos.
- 29 Elul is used rather than Rosh Hashanah because the tenth animal is normally painted and this cannot be done on Yom Tov.
- Rebbi Meir holds 1 Elul is Rosh Hashanah for Ma’aser Behemah.
- Rebbi Elazar and Rebbi Shimon hold 1 Tishrei is Rosh Hashanah.
- Ben Azai therefore treats all animals born during Elul as a separate group.
- His uncertainty comes from conflicting received traditions, not an inability to decide a logical argument.

- Animals born on opposite sides of a Goren can combine because a Goren does not create a new Ma’aser year.
- Animals born on opposite sides of Rosh Hashanah cannot combine.
- Rava gives a method using five Av animals, five Elul animals and five Tishrei animals, ensuring that the tenth comes from Elul.
- Ma’aser Behemah is normally performed by passing animals one by one through a narrow opening.
- The tenth animal is marked with red paint and declared Ma’aser.
- The paint and ideal counting procedure are not Me’akev.
- If an already-counted animal jumps back into the flock, the count becomes problematic.
- If the actual Ma’aser animal becomes mixed back into the flock, the Kadosh animal must be dealt with appropriately.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל