Bechoros 51 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Torah Payments – Why Repeat the Standard?

The Daf continues the discussion of the Torah's fixed monetary payments.

The Mishnah had taught that payments such as:

👉 Thirty Sela'im when an ox kills an Eved
👉 Fifty Sela'im for Ones and Mefateh
👉 One hundred Sela'im for Motzi Shem Ra

are calculated using the Torah standard of Kesef Tzuri.

The Gemara asks why the Mishnah needs to teach this separately.

The answer is that we might otherwise have thought that where the Torah does not explicitly use the word Shekalim, a lower denomination could be used.

👉 The Mishnah therefore teaches that these Torah payments are learned from one another and use the proper Shekel HaKodesh standard.

Kesef or Shaveh Kesef

2️⃣ Most Payments Can Be Made With Something of Value

The Mishnah taught that these obligations can generally be paid with:

👉 Kesef – actual money

or:

👉 Shaveh Kesef – an item worth the required amount.

But there are important exceptions where actual coinage is required.

The Daf discusses three:

👉 Shekalim
👉 Ma'aser Sheni
👉 Re'ayon – money used for the Olas Re'iyah.

3️⃣ Shekalim – Minted Money

The Shekalim sent to the Beis HaMikdash must ultimately be in proper coinage.

If many people send their Shekalim together, carrying large quantities of silver could be extremely difficult.

Therefore:

👉 The coins may be exchanged into higher-value gold coins for easier transportation.

But they cannot simply be converted into:

👉 A bar or lump of gold.

The replacement must still be:

👉 Minted currency.

4️⃣ Ma’aser Sheni – V’Tzarta HaKesef

Ma’aser Sheni applies in years:

👉 One, two, four and five of the Shemittah cycle.

If bringing the produce itself to Yerushalayim is too difficult:

👉 Its Kedushah can be transferred onto money.

The Torah says:

👉 V’Tzarta HaKesef B’Yadcha.

The Daf understands “V’Tzarta” as requiring:

👉 Money with a Tzurah – minted coinage.

The person then takes the money to Yerushalayim and uses it to purchase food there.

5️⃣ Re’ayon – Respectable Money for the Azarah

When a person comes to the Beis HaMikdash for Aliyah L’Regel, he brings an Olas Re’iyah.

The money used should not be:

👉 Inferior-quality silver.

Rather:

👉 Proper coinage should be brought to the Azarah.

What Cannot Be Used for Pidyon HaBen?

6️⃣ Three Major Exclusions

The Mishnah now gives three things that cannot be used to redeem a Bechor:

👉 Avadim – slaves
👉 Karka – real estate
👉 Shtaros – documents or notes.

So although Pidyon HaBen can be performed with many forms of Shaveh Kesef:

👉 These are excluded.

A valuable property cannot simply be transferred to the Kohen as the Pidyon.

Likewise, a document promising payment does not itself perform the Pidyon.

7️⃣ What Does the Mishnah Mean by Hekdeshos?

The Mishnah also mentions Hekdeshos.

At first glance, this might sound like:

👉 Using Hekdesh property to redeem the child.

But that would obviously be impossible because Hekdesh property does not belong to the father.

The Gemara therefore explains:

👉 The Mishnah is discussing how Hekdesh itself may be redeemed.

The same limitations concerning Avadim, Karka and Shtaros become relevant to redemption of Hekdesh.

“I Owe the Kohen Five Sela’im”

8️⃣ Writing a Document to the Kohen

Suppose the father writes a Shtar to a Kohen stating:

👉 “I owe you five Sela’im for my son's Pidyon HaBen.”

The Mishnah rules:

👉 The father must pay the five Sela’im written in the document.

But:

👉 His son is not redeemed through that payment.

Why?

The Chachamim were concerned that people would misunderstand what happened.

They might think:

👉 The Shtar itself can be used for Pidyon HaBen.

But a Shtar is specifically excluded from Pidyon HaBen.

Therefore, the father must pay what he promised:

👉 And then perform a proper Pidyon HaBen separately.

9️⃣ Can the Kohen Simply Forgive the Debt?

Suppose the Kohen says:

👉 "Don't worry about the five Sela'im. I am Mochel."

That does not solve the problem.

The father must actually give him the money.

However:

👉 Once the Kohen genuinely receives it, he may give it back as a gift.

So there is a major difference between:

👉 Never receiving the money because of Mechilah

and:

👉 Receiving it properly and then returning it as a new gift.

Money Set Aside for Pidyon Is Lost

🔟 You Must Pay Again

Suppose a father separates five Sela'im for Pidyon HaBen.

Before giving them to the Kohen:

👉 The money is lost.

The Mishnah rules:

👉 He must replace it and pay again.

The loss is the father's responsibility.

Simply setting aside the money does not complete the Mitzvah.

The Mishnah derives this from:

👉 “Ach Padoh Sifdeh.”

The obligation remains until the Pidyon is actually accomplished.

Rebbe vs the Chachamim

1️⃣1️⃣ Can You Redeem With Land or a Slave?

The Mishnah excludes:

👉 Avadim
👉 Karka
👉 Shtaros.

Rebbe disagrees.

Rebbe says:

👉 Almost anything can be used for Pidyon HaBen.

His only exclusion is:

👉 Shtaros.

Therefore, according to Rebbe:

👉 A slave or real estate can potentially be used.

This Machlokes depends upon a fundamental method of interpreting Pesukim.

Ribui – Miut – Ribui

1️⃣2️⃣ Rebbe’s Approach

Rebbe interprets the Pesukim using:

👉 Ribui – Miut – Ribui.

The Torah first broadens the possibilities, then limits them, and then broadens them again.

The result of this method is:

👉 Include almost everything.

But one category – the item furthest removed from ordinary monetary value – is excluded.

That is:

👉 A Shtar.

Why?

A Shtar does not possess significant inherent value.

Its importance comes from:

👉 The debt or right written upon it.

Therefore Rebbe excludes Shtaros but includes Avadim and Karka.

Klal – Prat – Klal

1️⃣3️⃣ The Chachamim's Approach

The Chachamim interpret the same Pesukim using:

👉 Klal – Prat – Klal.

The general rule is:

👉 We include items similar to the Prat.

The Prat here teaches that the item used for Pidyon should have characteristics similar to money.

It should be:

👉 Movable

and:

👉 Possess inherent monetary value.

1️⃣4️⃣ Why Are All Three Excluded?

Karka is excluded because:

👉 It is not movable.

Shtaros are excluded because:

👉 They do not possess inherent monetary value.

What about an Eved?

Throughout Shas:

👉 Avadim are compared Halachically to Karka.

Therefore:

👉 Avadim are excluded together with land.

This produces the Mishnah's three exclusions:

👉 Avadim, Karka and Shtaros.

But Doesn't Rebbe Usually Use Klal U'Prat?

1️⃣ 5️⃣ A Challenge From Eved Ivri

The Gemara challenges Rebbe's position.

Elsewhere, concerning an Eved Ivri who refuses to leave his master, the Torah requires his ear to be pierced.

The Gemara discusses what instrument can be used:

👉 A Martzea
👉 A thorn
👉 A needle
👉 A drill-like implement
👉 A stylus and other piercing instruments.

Rebbe's interpretation there appears to use:

👉 Klal U'Prat.

So how can our Daf say that Rebbe uses:

👉 Ribui U'Miut?

1️⃣6️⃣ Two General Expressions Followed by a Detail

The answer lies in the unusual structure of our Pesukim.

Here, the Torah does not present the standard sequence:

👉 Klal – Prat – Klal.

Instead, it effectively presents:

👉 Two general expressions followed by the limiting detail.

Rebbe treats this unusual structure as:

👉 Ribui – Miut – Ribui.

This allows him to include everything except Shtaros.

1️⃣7️⃣ The Chachamim Rearrange the Structure

The Chachamim understand the structure differently.

They treat the limiting expression as though it stands between the two general expressions.

That creates the familiar:

👉 Klal – Prat – Klal.

The result is that only items similar to the Prat are included.

Therefore:

👉 Avadim, Karka and Shtaros are all excluded.

Paying the Kohen in Instalments

1️⃣8️⃣ Must All Five Sela'im Be Given Together?

The Daf teaches an important practical Halachah.

The five Sela'im do not necessarily need to be handed over:

👉 In one single payment.

They may be given:

👉 One amount after another.

The Pidyon can still be valid once the Kohen has received the full required value.

1️⃣9️⃣ Can Different Kohanim Receive the Money?

The discussion goes even further.

The five Sela'im do not necessarily need to go to:

👉 One Kohen.

The required amount can be distributed among:

👉 Different Kohanim.

Once the full amount has been properly given:

👉 The father can fulfil his Pidyon obligation.

Can the Kohen Give the Money Back?

2️⃣0️⃣ Matana Al Menas Lehachzir

A Kohen may receive the five Sela'im properly and afterwards:

👉 Return them to the father as a gift.

This can be a valid Pidyon.

Rebbi Tarfon was known to:

👉 Receive the Pidyon money and then return it.

The Gemara confirms that this practice can work.

The crucial point is:

👉 The original giving must have been genuine.

2️⃣1️⃣ You Cannot Choose a Kohen Only Because He Gives It Back

This creates a concern.

If one Kohen is known always to return the five Sela'im:

👉 Everyone may choose him instead of other Kohanim.

This risks undermining the proper system of Matanos Kehunah.

The Daf therefore emphasizes that the giving must be:

👉 A real and unconditional transfer.

The father cannot treat the Pidyon as though he is guaranteed to receive his money back.

The Father Who Waited for His Money Back

2️⃣ 2️⃣ A Memorable Pidyon HaBen Story

A Kohen received the five Sela'im for a Pidyon HaBen.

Afterwards, the father remained nearby:

👉 Walking around and clearly waiting for the Kohen to return the money.

The Kohen realized what had happened.

The father had apparently given the money expecting:

👉 That it would automatically come straight back.

The Kohen told him:

👉 The original gift was not genuine.

Therefore:

👉 The Pidyon was not valid.

The father had to genuinely give the money without retaining an expectation or claim that it would be returned.

📌 **The Principle**

The Kohen may independently choose afterwards to return the money.

But:

👉 The father's original Nesinah must be complete.

Lost Pidyon Money

2️⃣ 3️⃣ Why Must It Be Replaced?

The Gemara returns to money that was designated for Pidyon HaBen and then lost.

It initially brings a comparison from:

👉 Erchin.

In Erchin, if money designated for an obligation is lost:

👉 The obligation remains.

The Gemara considers learning Pidyon HaBen from Erchin through the repeated expression:

👉 Erech – Erech.

2️⃣4️⃣ Rav Papa – We Already Have a Pasuk!

Rav Papa objects.

Why do we need to derive this law from Erchin?

The Mishnah itself already provided a direct source:

👉 “Ach Padoh Sifdeh.”

That Pasuk teaches that if the Pidyon money is lost:

👉 The father must replace it.

Therefore, the Erchin comparison must be needed for:

👉 A different Halachah.

When the Obligation Passes to the Heirs

2️⃣5️⃣ The Erchin Comparison

The Gemara explains that the comparison to Erchin teaches about an obligation that remains after death.

Where the Pidyon obligation had already taken effect:

👉 The monetary obligation does not simply disappear.

Just as an established Erchin obligation can continue against the estate:

👉 The Pidyon HaBen obligation can also continue.

Therefore:

👉 The Yorshim can become responsible for satisfying the established debt.

This continues the Daf's broader discussion of Pidyon HaBen not merely as a Mitzvah, but as a monetary obligation once it has taken effect.

📌 Key Chazarah

- Torah payments such as Ones, Mefateh and Motzi Shem Ra use the proper Torah monetary standard.
- Most Torah monetary obligations can be paid with Kesef or Shaveh Kesef.
- Shekalim, Ma’aser Sheni and Re’ayon require proper coinage.
- Shekalim may be exchanged into higher-value minted coins for easier transportation, but not simply into a lump of gold.
- Ma’aser Sheni is transferred onto minted money before being taken to Yerushalayim.
- The Chachamim say Pidyon HaBen cannot be performed with Avadim, Karka or Shtaros.
- Rebbe excludes only Shtaros and allows Avadim and Karka.
- Their Machlokes depends upon Ribui-Miut-Ribui versus Klal-Prat-Klal.
- A Shtar lacks inherent value; Karka is immovable; Avadim are Halachically compared to Karka.
- Writing that you owe a Kohen five Sela’im does not itself perform Pidyon HaBen.
- If such a document was written, the father must pay the Kohen and still perform a proper Pidyon.
- The Kohen cannot simply waive that required payment, although after receiving it he may return it as a gift.
- Five Sela’im may be given in separate payments and can even be distributed among different Kohanim.
- A Kohen may return properly received Pidyon money, as Rebbi Tarfon did.
- However, the father's original gift must be genuine and cannot be given on the assumption that it will automatically be returned.
- If money set aside for Pidyon HaBen is lost, the father must replace it.
- Rav Papa points out that the Mishnah already has a direct Pasuk for this law.

- The comparison to Erchin instead teaches that an established monetary obligation can continue to the Yorshim.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל