Bechoros 11 – Good Morning Raboisai

1️⃣ Petor Chamor After Arifah

👉 The Daf continues the Machlokes about Petor Chamor.

Rebbe Yehudah holds:

- While alive, before Pidyon, it is Assur B'Hanaah.

Rebbe Shimon holds:

- While alive, it is Mutar B'Hanaah.

The question is:

- What happens after Arifah, when the owner chooses not to redeem the donkey and instead breaks its neck?

Rav Nachman says that even according to Rebbe Shimon:

- After Arifah it becomes Assur B'Hanaah. 11_transcript

2️⃣ Arifah from Eglah Arufah

👉 The source is a Gezeirah Shavah:

- Arifah is written by Petor Chamor.
- Arifah is also written by Eglah Arufah.

Just as an Eglah Arufah becomes:

- Assur B'Hanaah,

so too a Petor Chamor after Arifah is:

- Assur B'Hanaah.

3️⃣ Why Is a Limud Needed According to Rebbe Yehudah?

👉 The Gemara asks:

According to Rebbe Yehudah, the Petor Chamor was already:

- Assur B'Hanaah while alive.

Why would we need a special source to teach that it remains forbidden:

- After Arifah?

Perhaps we would have thought:

Just as Pidyon removes the Issur:

- Arifah also removes the Issur.

Therefore, the Gezeirah Shavah teaches:

- Arifah does not permit it.

4️⃣ A Punishment for Refusing to Redeem

👉 The Gemara describes Arifah as a loss imposed on the owner:

He refused to:

- Redeem the donkey and give the Seh to the Kohen.

Therefore:

- He suffers a financial loss.

This is Midah K'neged Midah:

- He tried to deprive the Kohen, so he loses the value of his donkey.

5️⃣ Where Is the Loss According to Rebbe Yehudah?

👉 But according to Rebbe Yehudah:

- The donkey was already Assur B’Hanaah.

So what additional financial loss occurs through:

- Arifah?

The Gemara explains that while alive, the donkey still has:

- Bein HaBeinayim – the difference between its value and the cost of redeeming it.

For example:

- Donkey worth 1,000
- Seh worth 500

After redeeming it:

- The owner effectively retains 500 of value.

Arifah causes him to lose:

- That remaining value.

6️⃣ The Loss According to Rebbe Shimon

👉 According to Rebbe Shimon, another possibility is:

The donkey may remain:

- Mutar B’Hanaah even after Arifah.

Nevertheless, the owner still suffers a major loss because:

- A living donkey is valuable.
- A dead donkey is worth far less.

So Arifah itself:

- Causes the financial punishment.

7️⃣ Reish Lakish and Rebbe Yochanan

👉 Reish Lakish holds:

According to Rebbe Shimon:

- Before Arifah – Mutar B'Hanaah.
- After Arifah – Assur B'Hanaah.

Rebbe Yochanan, in the name of Rebbe Elazar, holds that:

- The Machlokes can continue even after Arifah.

Meaning Rebbe Shimon can maintain that:

- It remains Mutar B'Hanaah.

Kiddushin with a Petor Chamor

8️⃣ Can a Petor Chamor Be Used for Kiddushin?

👉 The Gemara discusses someone who tells a woman:

- "Harei At Mekudeshes Li with this Petor Chamor."

Whether the Kiddushin works depends on:

- Whether the donkey has monetary value for him.

According to Rebbe Shimon:

- If it is Mutar B'Hanaah, it clearly has value.

According to Rebbe Yehudah:

- Even though it is Assur B'Hanaah, there can still be value in the Bein HaBeinayim.

9️⃣ The Value Remaining After Pidyon

👉 Suppose:

- The donkey is worth 1,000

- The required redemption costs 500.

Even according to Rebbe Yehudah, the owner has:

- 500 of potential value.

Once he redeems it:

- The donkey becomes fully usable.

Therefore, an object being presently Assur B'Hanaah does not necessarily mean:

- It has absolutely no monetary interest for its owner.

When Must Petor Chamor Be Redeemed?

🔟 Tifdeh – Immediately

👉 The Torah repeats the command to redeem:

- Petor Chamor.

One Drashah teaches:

- Tifdeh Miyad

Unlike Pidyon HaBen:

- There is no need to wait thirty days.

A Petor Chamor may be redeemed:

- Immediately.

1️⃣1️⃣ Why Might We Have Thought Thirty Days?

👉 Bechor Adam and Petor Chamor appear together in the Pesukim.

Therefore, we might have compared them:

Just as Pidyon HaBen requires:

- Thirty days
- And five Selaim,

perhaps Petor Chamor also requires:

- Thirty days
- And a substantial minimum value.

The Pasuk teaches:

- Petor Chamor can be redeemed immediately.

How Much Must the Pidyon Be Worth?

1️⃣2️⃣ Kol Shehu or a Shekel?

👉 The Gemara discusses the minimum value required for:

- Pidyon Petor Chamor.

One opinion holds:

- Kol Shehu – even something of very small value can work.

Another requires:

- At least a Shekel.

The Shekel requirement is connected to the general minimum value found in:

- Erchin.

1️⃣3️⃣ Halachah Like the Chachamim

👉 Rav Nachman says:

- Halachah K'Divrei Chachamim.

The Chachamim permit redemption with:

- Kol Shehu.

The Gemara nevertheless discusses practical amounts that should be given:

- Rather than merely the technical minimum.

1️⃣4️⃣ The Question to Rebbe Tarfon

👉 Someone asked Rebbe Tarfon:

How much should I give the Kohen for:

- Pidyon Petor Chamor?

He answered:

- Ayin Yafah – generously, a Sela.
- Ayin Ra'ah – a Shekel.
- Beinonis – the middle amount.

The middle amount is:

- Three Zuz.

This is called:

- Regiya.

1️⃣5️⃣ Kol Shehu or Three Zuz?

👉 The Gemara asks:

Rav Nachman said the Halachah is:

- Kol Shehu.

Yet now the Gemara says:

- Three Zuz.

The answer:

When someone comes to ask:

- We instruct him to give the proper Beinonis amount.

But regarding the basic validity of the Pidyon:

- A smaller amount can still work.

Must the Redemption Be a Seh?

1️⃣6️⃣ Seh or Full Value

👉 The Torah specifically mentions redeeming Petor Chamor with:

- A Seh.

However, the Gemara explains that redemption can also be performed with:

- Other items of value.

The difference is:

With a Seh:

- It can redeem the donkey even when worth much less.

With other items:

- The full value of the donkey must be given.

👉 The Seh is therefore:

- A special leniency.

1️⃣7️⃣ Redeeming with Other Property

👉 The transcript gives the example of using:

- Cooked vegetables or other property.

If one does not use a Seh:

- He must give the Kohen the donkey's full value.

Therefore:

- A cheap Seh can be far more advantageous.

Redeeming Someone Else's Petor Chamor

1️⃣8️⃣ Can I Redeem Your Donkey?

👉 Rav Sheizvi says in the name of Rav Huna:

If someone redeems:

- His friend's Petor Chamor,

the redemption works.

This is different from certain other Mitzvos where:

- The owner's consent is required.

So even another person can successfully perform:

- The Pidyon.

1️⃣9️⃣ Who Gets the Donkey?

👉 This creates a fascinating question.

If I redeem:

- Your Petor Chamor,

does the donkey now become:

- Mine

because I performed the Pidyon?

Or does it remain:

- Yours?

According to Rebbe Shimon, the answer seems straightforward:

- The original owner already had the right to benefit from it.

Therefore:

- It remains his donkey.

The greater question is according to:

- Rebbe Yehudah.

2️⃣0️⃣ Is Petor Chamor Like Hekdesh?

👉 According to Rebbe Yehudah, the donkey is:

- Assur B'Hanaah before Pidyon.

Perhaps it resembles:

- Hekdesh,

where the person who redeems it can acquire:

- The redeemed object.

Or perhaps the original owner retains:

- The Bein HaBeinayim

and therefore still has ownership in:

- The donkey.

2️⃣1️⃣ The Proof from Kefel

👉 The Gemara brings a powerful proof.

If someone steals:

- A Petor Chamor,

he can be liable to pay:

- Kefel.

But according to Rebbe Yehudah, the owner cannot currently use:

- The donkey.

Why is stealing it considered:

- Stealing his property?

Because the owner has a future monetary right:

- He can redeem it and then use its full value.

👉 This shows that despite the present Issur Hanaah:

- The donkey remains financially connected to its original owner.

Safek Petor Chamor and Maaser Behemah

2️⃣2️⃣ Ten Safek Donkeys

👉 The Mishnah taught that a Seh separated for a Safek Petor Chamor can still be used in:

- Maaser Behemah.

The Gemara discusses someone with:

- Ten Safek Petor Chamorim.

He separates:

- Ten sheep.

Since the Kohen cannot prove that the Safek animals were definitely obligated:

- The owner can retain the sheep.

He then puts the sheep through:

- Maaser Behemah.

One becomes:

- Maaser

and the remaining nine:

- Stay with him.

Inheritance Through a Kohen

2️⃣3️⃣ Yisrael → Kohen → Yisrael

👉 The Gemara discusses an unusual inheritance case.

A Yisrael owns definite:

- Petor Chamorim.

They are inherited by:

- A Kohen.

The Kohen would perform the Pidyon but:

- Keep the sheep himself.

The property is later inherited from that Kohen by:

- A Yisrael.

The final Yisrael performs the necessary Pidyon, but:

- He can retain the sheep.

Why?

Because he inherited the monetary rights that:

- The Kohen possessed.

The Same Principle with Terumos and Maasros

2️⃣4️⃣ Inherited Produce

👉 The Gemara gives a similar case involving:

- Produce requiring Terumos and Maasros.

A Kohen who inherited the produce would have certain rights to:

- The gifts.

If that right is subsequently inherited by:

- A Yisrael,

the Yisrael can retain the gifts that:

- His Kohen predecessor was entitled to keep.

2️⃣5️⃣ Why Do We Need Both Cases?

👉 The Gemara explains why we need both:

- Petor Chamor
- And produce.

With Petor Chamor:

- The sheep is a separate object that must still be brought and designated.

With produce:

- The Terumah and Maaser are already contained within the pile.

We might therefore have thought that the inherited rights work:

- Only in one of these situations.

The Gemara teaches:

- The principle applies to both.

Produce Bought from a Non-Jew

2️⃣6️⃣ Miruach and Maaser

👉 The Gemara discusses produce owned by a non-Jew where:

- A Jew performs the Miruach – the final smoothing of the pile.

The transcript explains the principle:

- Ein Kinyan L'Nochri B'Eretz Yisrael L'Hafkia Miyad Maaser.

Non-Jewish ownership of land in Eretz Yisrael does not necessarily:

- Remove the obligation of Maaser.

The Gemara then discusses:

- What must be separated
- And what the Kohen can actually demand.

Produce Left with Others

2️⃣7️⃣ Was the Produce Switched?

👉 If produce is deposited with:

- A Kusi
- An Am Ha'aretz
- Or a non-Jew,

the Gemara discusses whether we are concerned that:

- The produce was exchanged.

This affects whether:

- Terumos and Maasros must be separated again.

There can also be a distinction between:

- Having to separate the gifts

and:

- Whether the Kohen can actually demand them.

If the Seh Dies

2️⃣8️⃣ The Kohen's Right Begins Once It Is Separated

👉 The Mishnah taught that if the Seh used for Petor Chamor dies:

- One may benefit from it.

The Gemara explains the Chiddush.

A Yisrael separated a Seh to give to:

- The Kohen,

but before he actually handed it over:

- The Seh died.

We might have thought that because it remained physically:

- In the Yisrael's possession,

the Kohen never acquired rights to it.

The Gemara teaches:

Once it was properly separated:

- The Kohen already has a monetary right in it.

Therefore, even if it dies before being handed over:

- It still belongs to the Kohen for purposes of Hanaah.

📌 Key Chazarah

- Rebbe Shimon permits Hanaah from a living Petor Chamor before Pidyon; the Gemara discusses whether this changes after Arifah.
- Arifah of Petor Chamor is compared to Eglah Arufah.
- Even according to Rebbe Yehudah, a Petor Chamor has monetary value through the Bein HaBeinayim.
- Petor Chamor may be redeemed immediately; unlike Pidyon HaBen, there is no thirty-day wait.
- The Gemara discusses whether the minimum Pidyon is Kol Shehu or a Shekel.
- Rebbe Tarfon gives three Zuz as the normal Beinonis amount when someone asks how much to give.
- A Seh may redeem a Petor Chamor even when worth far less than the donkey.
- Other property can also be used, but must equal the donkey's full value.
- Someone can redeem another person's Petor Chamor.
- The Gemara discusses whether the redeemed donkey belongs to the redeemer or remains with its original owner.
- The obligation of Kefel shows that even according to Rebbe Yehudah, the original owner retains monetary rights in the donkey.
- Ten sheep separated for Safek Petor Chamorim can enter Maaser Behemah.
- The Daf discusses inherited rights passing from a Yisrael to a Kohen and then back to a Yisrael.
- A similar principle applies to Terumos and Maasros.
- Once a Seh has been separated for the Kohen, the Kohen has rights to it even if it dies before reaching his hands.

📘 Catch up, review, download previous Dafim & more:
https://www.dafchazarah.co.uk
📲 Now available as an app (Apple, Google & Amazon):
https://dafchazarah.co.uk/download
🤝 Sponsor a day: https://dafchazarah.co.uk/sponsor
לעילוי נשמת אמי מורתי רות בת הרב מנחם מנדל